

Nineteenth-Century Music *Review*



Music, Medical Science and the Body

Retrospect Opera: Reviving Britain's
Nineteenth-Century Operatic Past

Volume **19** • Issue **1** • **April 2022**

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Nineteenth-Century Music Review locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER

Louisiana State University, USA

JAMES SOBASKIE (CD/DVD Review Editor)

Mississippi State University, USA

NANCY NOVEMBER (Score Review Editor)

University of Auckland, New Zealand

HEATHER PLATT (Digital Review Editor)

Ball State University, USA

SANNA PEDERSON (Book Review Editor)

University of Oklahoma, USA

KATHERINE PRESTON

William & Mary, USA

WILLIAM WEBER

California State University, Long Beach, USA

BENJAMIN M. KORSTVEDT

Clark University, USA

Advisory Board

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN

University of Chicago, USA

ANDREW BOWIE

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

SUZANNAH CLARK

Harvard University, USA

NICHOLAS COOK

University of Cambridge, UK

JOHN DEATHRIDGE

King's College, University of London, UK

JAMES DEAVILLE

Carleton University, Canada

JEREMY DIBBLE

Durham University, UK

STEPHEN DOWNES

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

KATHARINE ELLIS

University of Cambridge, UK

ANNEGRET FAUSER

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

PETER FRANKLIN

University of Oxford, UK

SOPHIE FULLER

Trinity College of Music, UK

LYDIA GOEHR

Columbia University, USA

THOMAS GREY

Stanford University, USA

SARAH HIBBERD

University of Bristol, UK

JULIAN HORTON

Durham University, UK

LINDA HUTCHEON

University of Toronto, Canada

HERVÉ LACOMBE

Université Rennes 2, Haute Bretagne, France

ALICIA LEVIN

University of Kansas, USA

RALPH LOCKE

Eastman School of Music, USA

ROBERTA MARVIN

University of Massachusetts, USA

SIMON McVEIGH

Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

JULIAN RUSHTON

University of Leeds, UK

DOUGLASS SEATON

Florida State University, USA

SUSAN WOLLENBERG

University of Oxford, UK

SUSAN YOUENS

University of Notre Dame, USA

SUBSCRIPTIONS *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published three times a year in April, August and December. Three parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 19 (2022), which includes print and electronic access, is £265 net (US\$418 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £56 net (US\$89 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £102 (US\$160 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA.

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2019. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at cambridge.org/core.

© Cambridge University Press 2022

Contents

VOLUME 19, ISSUE 1

Notes on Article Contributors 1

INTRODUCTION

Mark A. Pottinger
Music, Medical Science and the Body 3

ARTICLES

Peter Pesic
Composing the Crisis: From Mesmer's Harmonica to Charcot's Tam-tam 7

Francesca Brittan
The Electrician, the Magician and the Nervous Conductor 31

Mark A. Pottinger
Lucia and the Auscultation of Disease in Mid-Nineteenth-Century France 55

Julia Kursell
'False Relations': Hermann von Helmholtz's Study of Music and the
Delineation of Nineteenth-Century Physiology 85

INTRODUCTION

Christina Fuhrmann
Retrospect Opera: Reviving Britain's Operatic Past 107

INTERVIEW

James Brooks Kuykendall
Retrospect Opera: Reviving a Forgotten Mainstream 111

CD REVIEW

- William A. Everett
The Boatswain's Mate, music and libretto by Ethel Smyth. Edition by Valerie Langfield Lontano Ensemble, conducted by Odaline de la Martinez Nadine Benjamin, *sop*; Edward Lee, *ten*; Jeremy Huw Williams, *bar*; Simon Wilding, *bass*; Ted Schmitz, *ten*; Rebecca Louise Dale, *mezzo-sop*; Mark Nathan, *bar*; Retrospect Opera RO001, 2016 (2 CDs: 73 minutes, 74 minutes)
Pickwick, music by Edward Solomon and libretto by F.C. Burnand
Cups and Saucers, music and libretto by George Grossmith; Simon Butteriss, *bar*; Gaylor Keeble, *mezzo-sop*; Toby Stafford-Allen, *bar*; and Alessandro MacKinnon, *treble*; directed from the piano by Stephen Higgins Retrospect Opera RO002, 2017 (1 CD: 74 minutes)

REVIEW ESSAYS

- Justin Vickers
 Nicholas Temperley, Edward Loder, and Retrospect Opera's *Raymond and Agnes* 127
- Paul Rodmell
 'Wanted – An Opera' 139
- Rose Mauro
 Historiographical Reflections on the Beethoven Year 250 143

BOOK REVIEWS

- James Porter
Beyond Fingal's Cave: Ossian in the Musical Imagination
 by David Ferris 159
- Sarah Collins
Music and Victorian Liberalism: Composing the Liberal Subject
 by Jennifer Oates 163
- Laura Tunbridge
Beethoven: A Life in Nine Pieces
 by Sarah Clemmens Waltz 167
- Jeremy Yudkin
From Silence to Sound: Beethoven's Beginnings
 by Jeffrey Swinkin 172
- Sarah Hibberd and Miranda Stanyon
Music and the Sonorous Sublime in European Culture, 1680–1880
 by Joshua A. Waggener 182

CD REVIEW

Laurie McManus

- Brahms: The Piano Quartets** The Primrose Piano Quartet Meridian, 187
CDE84650/1-2, 2019 (2 CDs: 124 minutes) \$27.50

DVD REVIEW

Gundula Kreuzer

- Richard Wagner, *Das Liebesverbot*** Christopher Maltman, *bar*, Peter Lodahl, 191
ten, Ilker Arcayürek, *ten*, David Alegret, *ten*, David Jerusalem, *bass*, Manuela
Uhl, *sop*, María Miró, *sop*, Ante Jerkunica, *bass*, Isaac Galán, *bar*, María
Hinojosa, *sop*, Francisco Vas, *ten*; Chorus and Orchestra of the Teatro Real,
Madrid, Ivor Bolton, *cond.* Kasper Holten, *stage director*; Opus Arte 1191,
2017 (1 DVD: 160 minutes), \$32.50

SCORE REVIEW

Otakar Ostrčil

- Písně na texty německých básníků. Songs to German Poems* 197
by Maria Behrendt

DIGITAL RESOURCE REVIEW

Sanna Pederson

- Digitized German-language Newspapers 199