

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

Volume 45

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/8913>

Mónika Ambrus · Ramses A. Wessel
Volume Editors

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2014

Between Pragmatism and Predictability:
Temporariness in International Law



ASSER PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Springer

Volume Editors

Mónika Ambrus
Department of International
and Constitutional Law
University of Groningen
Groningen
The Netherlands

Ramses A. Wessel
Centre for European Studies
University of Twente
Enschede
The Netherlands

ISSN 0167-6768 ISSN 1574-0951 (electronic)
Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
ISBN 978-94-6265-059-6 ISBN 978-94-6265-060-2 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-060-2

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2015

Library of Congress Control Number: 72-623109

This Volume is also available as a journal product, either as part of the subscription to Volume 61 of the Netherlands International Law Review, or as a stand-alone journal, both through Cambridge University Press. In addition to the electronic version published on <http://www.springerlink>, the Yearbook is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service.

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer Science+Business Media B.V. Dordrecht is part of Springer Science+Business Media
(www.springer.com)

Board of Editors

F. Amtenbrink
Erasmus University Rotterdam

H.G. van der Wilt
University of Amsterdam

W.J.M. van Genugten
(General Editor)
Tilburg University

M. den Heijer
University of Amsterdam

J.E. Nijman
University of Amsterdam

M. Kuijer
Ministry of Security and Justice

W.G. Werner
VU University, Amsterdam

D. Prévost
University of Maastricht

R.A. Wessel
(General Editor)
University of Twente

Managing Editor

M. Ambrus
Faculty of Law
University of Groningen
Oude Kijk in 't Jatstraat 26
9712 EK Groningen
The Netherlands

Aims and Scope

The Netherlands Yearbook of International Law (NYIL) was first published in 1970. As a double-blind peer-reviewed publication, the NYIL offers a forum for the publication of scholarly articles of a conceptual nature in a varying thematic area of public international law. In addition, each Yearbook includes a section *Dutch Practice in International Law*. The NYIL is published under the auspices of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut

Located in the ‘international zone’ of The Hague—the City of Justice, Peace and Security, The T.M.C. Asser Instituut is a leading, inter-university research institute operating in the broad field of international law.

Founded in 1965, the Institute’s international community of scholars is engaged in research, postgraduate training and dissemination of knowledge in furtherance of the purposes and principles of international law. This inter-university institute cooperates closely with and supports the Dutch universities’ activities in the relevant disciplines. The academic fields covered by the Institute are Private International Law, Public International Law, Law of the European Union, International Commercial Arbitration, International Humanitarian Law, International Criminal Law and International Sports Law.

The Institute enjoys an excellent reputation at national and international level for its development, organisation and hosting of conferences and academic meetings, demand-driven postgraduate programmes and training. Its ancillary websites and data collections all contribute to a coherent and integral strategy in the area of knowledge transfer.

The Institute has its own publishing house, T.M.C. Asser Press. The T.M.C. Asser Press not only serves the publishing needs of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut, but also those of academics and practitioners worldwide in the fields of International and European Law.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut
Institute for Private and Public International Law
International Commercial Arbitration and European Law

Institute Address:
R.J. Schimmelpennincklaan 20–22
2517 JN, The Hague
The Netherlands

Mailing Address:
P.O. Box 30461
2500 GL The Hague
The Netherlands
Tel.: +3170 342 0300
Fax: +3170 342 0359
Email: NYIL@asser.nl
Internet: www.asser.nl

Contents

Part I Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law

1	Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law	3
	Mónika Ambrus and Ramses A. Wessel	
1.1	Introduction	4
1.2	Forms of Temporariness.	5
	1.2.1 Temporary Objects.	6
	1.2.2 Temporary Subjects	8
1.3	International Law and Change	9
	1.3.1 Temporary Objects and International Law.	9
	1.3.2 Temporary Subjects and International Law	13
1.4	Conclusion: All Relative?	15
	References.	16
2	Temporariness and Change in Global Governance	19
	Rene Uruena	
2.1	Introduction	20
2.2	International Law in a Constant Present	21
2.3	Change and Temporariness	26
	2.3.1 Change and Temporariness in a Global Regulatory Space.	28
	2.3.2 Thinking About Change in the Constant Present	32
2.4	Normative Challenges	33
2.5	Conclusion	37
	References.	38

3	Temporary International Legal Regimes as Frames for Permanent Ones	41
	Jean Galbraith	
3.1	Introduction	42
3.2	Why Use Temporary International Legal Regimes?	44
3.2.1	Factors Favouring the Use of Temporary Regimes	44
3.2.2	Sources of Strength for Temporary Regimes	47
3.3	Temporary Regimes as Foundations for Permanent Regimes	48
3.3.1	Causes	49
3.3.2	Implications	51
3.4	Case Studies	54
3.4.1	Refugee Law	54
3.4.2	International Criminal Law	58
3.4.3	Climate Change	61
3.5	Conclusion	63
	References	63
4	The International Rule of Law Time After Time: Temporary Institutions Between Change and Continuity	67
	Sofia Ranchordás	
4.1	Introduction	68
4.2	The (International) Rule of Law as a Source of Legal Certainty	71
4.2.1	The Rule of Law: Here, There and Everywhere?	71
4.2.2	The International Rule of Law and Time	76
4.2.3	The International Rule of Law as a Law of Lasting Rules?	78
4.3	Temporary Rules, Institutions and Measures	82
4.3.1	Temporary Legislation and the Rule of Law at Home	82
4.3.2	International Temporary Institutions, Rules and Measures	85
4.4	Conclusion	87
	References	89
5	International Law and Time: A Reflection of the Temporal Attitudes of International Lawyers Through Three Paradigms	93
	Christian Djeflal	
5.1	International Law in Time: The Familiar Stranger	94
5.2	Paradigm Shifts	96
5.2.1	The Temporalisation of International Law	97
5.2.2	The Flexibilisation of International Legal Time?	104
5.3	General Conclusions	115
	References	117

6 (Inter)Temporal Considerations in the Interpretative Process of the VCLT: Do Treaties Endure, Perdure or Exdure? 121
 Panos Merkouris

6.1 Introduction 122

6.2 Definitional Issues 125

6.2.1 Endurantism, Perdurantism, and Exdurantism. 125

6.2.2 Intertemporal Law 128

6.2.3 Principle of Contemporaneity and Evolutive/Dynamic Interpretation 129

6.3 Silence Can Speak Volumes: The Lack of Explicit References to Intertemporal Considerations in the VCLT 134

6.3.1 Pre-VCLT Considerations on the Topic 134

6.3.2 Rejection of Explicit Incorporation of the Doctrine of Intertemporal Law in the VCLT: Draft Article 56 135

6.3.3 Rejection of Explicit Solutions to Intertemporal Considerations Through the Backdoor of Article 31 137

6.4 Points of Entry of Intertemporal Considerations in Article 31 VCLT. 139

6.4.1 Direct Point of Entry 139

6.4.2 Indirect Point of Entry 144

6.5 Limits 150

6.6 Conclusion 151

References. 152

7 Shifting Demands in International Institutional Law: Securing the United Nations’ Accountability for the Haitian Cholera Outbreak. 157
 Kate Nancy Taylor

7.1 Introduction 158

7.2 The Responsibility of the UN for the Cholera Outbreak 159

7.3 The UN’s Jurisdictional Immunity. 161

7.4 Alternative Modes of Dispute Settlement 164

7.4.1 The UN’s Obligation to Settle Private Law Disputes. 164

7.4.2 Would the Cholera Claims Fall Within the Scope of the UN’s Liability?. 165

7.4.3 Dispute Settlement Mechanisms in UN Peacekeeping Operations 169

7.5 Shifting Demands in the Law of International Organisations 172

7.5.1 Would a Domestic Court Be Willing to Adjudicate the Cholera Claims?. 172

7.5.2 Elevating the Cholera Claims to an International Level . . . 176

7.5.3 The Rule of Law in the UN and the Handling of the Cholera Claims. 178

7.5.4 The Human Rights Imperative 180

7.5.5 Demands for the Enhanced Accountability of the UN. 183

7.6 Permanent Versus *Ad Hoc* Solutions 187

 7.6.1 Theorising Permanent Solutions 187

 7.6.2 *Ad Hoc* Solutions: A Revised Role
 for Domestic Courts? 189

7.7 Conclusion 191

References 192

**8 Protecting Human Rights During Emergencies: Delegation,
Derogation, and Deference 197**

Evan J. Criddle

8.1 Introduction 198

8.2 The Resilience of Derogation Standards 201

8.3 Derogation Standards as Delegations 206

8.4 Deference for an Altruistic Regime 212

8.5 Conclusion 218

References 219

9 Temporary Protection: Hovering at the Edges of Refugee Law 221

Jean-François Durieux

9.1 Introduction 222

9.2 Time in the International Legal Regime 226

 9.2.1 Time as ‘Attachment’ 226

 9.2.2 Time as Deadline 227

 9.2.3 A Clash of Times 230

9.3 Temporary Protection in Europe, 1992–2001 232

 9.3.1 A Time of Crisis 233

 9.3.2 After the Crisis 240

9.4 Hovering on 244

9.5 Conclusion: Time for a Showdown 249

References 252

**10 Between the Devil and the Deep Blue Sea: Enhancing Flexibility
in International Climate Change Law 255**

Harro van Asselt

10.1 Introduction 256

10.2 Flexibility in the United Nations Climate Change Regime 258

 10.2.1 Delegated Law-Making 259

 10.2.2 Scientific Input 260

 10.2.3 Review and Amendment 262

 10.2.4 Entry into Force, Reservations and Withdrawal 265

 10.2.5 Differentiation 266

 10.2.6 Implementation 268

 10.2.7 Compliance 269

 10.2.8 Flexibility in the Climate Change Regime: Advances
 and Limitations 271

- 10.3 A Pluralist Approach to International Climate Change Law as an Alternative Model 272
 - 10.3.1 The Virtues of a Pluralist Approach. 273
 - 10.3.2 The Baby and the Bathwater 276
- 10.4 Enhancing Flexibility in International Climate Change Law 278
- 10.5 Conclusions 281
- References. 282

- 11 Commissions of Inquiry: Flexible Temporariness or Permanent Predictability?** 287

Christian Henderson

 - 11.1 Introduction 288
 - 11.2 Commissions of Inquiry as Temporary Adjudicative Bodies of International Law. 289
 - 11.3 The Impact of Temporary Commissions of Inquiry Upon International Legal Adjudication 295
 - 11.3.1 The Formality of International Legal Adjudication. 295
 - 11.3.2 The Principle of Non-intervention. 300
 - 11.3.3 Procedural Fairness 303
 - 11.4 Concluding Remarks: A Permanent Commission of Inquiry? 307
 - References. 310

- 12 Special Temporary Measures and the Norm of Equality** 311

Adeno Addis

 - 12.1 Introduction 312
 - 12.2 The Nature of Special Temporary Measures 317
 - 12.2.1 Special Rights and Special Measures 317
 - 12.2.2 The Nature of Special Measures 318
 - 12.3 Equality and Special Measures 321
 - 12.3.1 Equality as Non-discrimination (Equality of Treatment) 321
 - 12.3.2 Equality as Equality of Opportunity 322
 - 12.4 Temporariness and Predictability: The Issue of Durational Limit 325
 - 12.5 Temporariness and Predictability: The Virtue of Candor. 327
 - 12.6 Conclusion 329
 - References. 330

- 13 Paradise Postponed? For a Judge-Led Generic Model of International Criminal Procedure and an End to ‘Draft-as-You-Go’** 331

Michael Bohlander

 - 13.1 Introduction 332
 - 13.2 A Case in Point: The STL 337
 - 13.3 The Conceptual Framework: Purpose, Fairness and Efficiency 341
 - 13.3.1 Characteristics of Domestic Procedures 341

- 13.3.2 Problems of International Procedure: Geo-Politics, Mass Atrocities and Creation of a Historical Record . . . 342
- 13.3.3 Sources of International Criminal Procedure: The Limited Role of Human Rights Law 343
- 13.3.4 International Criminal Procedure and General Sources of International Law 344
- 13.3.5 Efficiency in Fairness: The Path Forward 345
- 13.4 Preferring the Judge-Led Model: Reasons and Parameters 346
 - 13.4.1 Romantic Views of the Role of the Judge in the Adversarial Trial 346
 - 13.4.2 Absence of the Dichotomy Between Spheres of Professional and Lay Adjudication 347
 - 13.4.3 Efficiency Aspects: Adversarial Versus Judge-Led Model 348
- 13.5 Conclusion 354
- References 355

Part II Dutch Practice in International Law

- 14 Platforms, Protestors and Provisional Measures: The Arctic Sunrise Dispute and Environmental Activism at Sea 359**
 - Richard Caddell
 - 14.1 Introduction 360
 - 14.2 The *Arctic Sunrise* Dispute 362
 - 14.2.1 Jurisdiction of the Tribunal 365
 - 14.2.2 Non-participation of the Respondent State 368
 - 14.2.3 Prompt Release and Provisional Measures 370
 - 14.3 Platforms and Protest Activism 374
 - 14.3.1 Offshore Installations and the Law of the Sea 374
 - 14.3.2 Freedom of Speech at Sea 378
 - 14.4 Concluding Remarks 382
 - References 383
- Table of Cases 385**
- Index 387**