

# THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## **Edited by**

John Baldwin, *Managing Editor*

Volker Halbach

Martin Otto

Deirdre Haskell

Michael Rathjen

Menachem Kojman

Erich Reck

André Nies

## **Reviews Editors**

Steve Awodey, *Managing Editor for Reviews*

John Burgess

Ernest Schimmerling

Mark Colyvan

Alex Simpson

Anuj Dawar

Kai Wehmeier

Noam Greenberg

Matthias Wille

Rahim Moosa

VOLUME 18 • NUMBER 4 • DECEMBER 2012 • ISSN 1079-8986

Copyright © 2012 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ARTICLES

The philosophy of logic, by PENELOPE MADDY .....	481
Fifty years of the spectrum problem: survey and new results, by ARNAUD DURAND, NEIL D. JONES, JOHANN A. MAKOWSKY, and MALIKA MORE .....	505
The graph-theoretic approach to descriptive set theory, by BENJAMIN D. MILLER .....	554

## REVIEWS

J. Krajíček, <i>Forcing with random variables and proof complexity</i> . Reviewed by Sam Buss .....	576
Several papers on automatic randomness. Reviewed by Mia Minnes .....	579

---

Officers and Committees of the Association for Symbolic Logic .....	581
Members of the Association .....	586
Notices .....	640

---

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN print: 1079-8986, ISSN online: 1943-5894) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc., 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604-0001, USA. Periodicals postage is paid at Poughkeepsie, NY and at additional mailing offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC. The 2012 annual subscription price for the two journals, in either print or electronic form, is US\$625; visit <http://www.aslonline.org/Journals-subscription.html> for more information. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic, c/o American Mathematical Society, 201 Charles Street, Providence, RI 02904-2294, USA*. Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, Charles Steinhorn (address on inside back cover).

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL, and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in all aspects of symbolic logic. The BULLETIN encourages submission of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

*Articles* should be of broad interest and accessible to a wide audience of logicians. They may be purely expository, survey, or historical articles, or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

*Communications* should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final versions.

*Continued on inside back cover*

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 17 16 15 14 13 12