

THE
JOURNAL
OF
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ALONZO CHURCH S. C. KLEENE ALICE A. LAZEROWITZ

Managing Editor: ALFONS BORGERS

Consulting Editors:

W. ACKERMANN
C. A. BAYLIS
PAUL BERNAYS
G. D. W. BERRY
MARTIN DAVIS

ROBERT FEYS
FREDERIC B. FITCH
CARL G. HEMPEL
LEON HENKIN
JOHN G. KEMENY

ANDRZEJ MOSTOWSKI
RÓZSA PÉTER
BARKLEY ROSSER
THORALF SKOLEM
A. R. TURQUETTE

VOLUME 21

1956

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC
WITH THE AID OF SUBVENTIONS FROM
EDWARD C. HEGELER TRUST FUND

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO
DARTMOUTH COLLEGE
DUKE UNIVERSITY
HARVARD UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED STUDY
UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS
LEHIGH UNIVERSITY

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA
UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA
PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY
RUTGERS UNIVERSITY
SMITH COLLEGE

STANFORD UNIVERSITY



THE
JOURNAL
OF
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ALONZO CHURCH S. C. KLEENE ALICE A. LAZEROWITZ

Managing Editor: ALFONS BORGERS

Consulting Editors:

W. ACKERMANN
C. A. BAYLIS
PAUL BERNAYS
G. D. W. BERRY
MARTIN DAVIS

ROBERT FEYS
FREDERIC B. FITCH
CARL G. HEMPEL
LEON HENKIN
JOHN G. KEMENY

ANDRZEJ MOSTOWSKI
RÓZSA PÉTER
BARKLEY ROSSER
THORALF SKOLEM
A. R. TURQUETTE

VOLUME 21

1956

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC

WITH THE AID OF SUBVENTIONS FROM

EDWARD C. HEGELER TRUST FUND

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO
DARTMOUTH COLLEGE
DUKE UNIVERSITY
HARVARD UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED STUDY
UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS
LEHIGH UNIVERSITY

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA
UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA
PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY
RUTGERS UNIVERSITY
SMITH COLLEGE

STANFORD UNIVERSITY

The four numbers of Volume 21 were issued at the following dates:

Number 1, pages 1–112, March 20, 1956.

Number 2, pages 113–224, July 2, 1956

Number 3, pages 225–336, September 28, 1956

Number 4, pages 337–426, April, 1957

All numbers of this volume are copyrighted by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the Journal by photostat, photo-print, micro-film, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission of the Managing Editor.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

A new approach to semantics – Part I. By JOHN G. KEMENY	1
Two concepts from the theory of models. By LEON HENKIN	28
Note on a problem of L. Henkin. By ABRAHAM ROBINSON	33
On the axiom of extensionality – Part I. By R. O. GANDY	36
Solution of a problem of Tarski. By JOHN MYHILL	49
Another variant of natural deduction. By IRVING M. COPI	52
Reduction to a symmetric predicate. By ALAN COBHAM	56
Modality and quantification in S5. By A. N. PRIOR	60
Formal systems of constructive mathematics. By M. H. LÖB	63
Reviews	76
Nineteenth meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic. By IRVING M. COPI and R. L. WILDER	109
Abstract of papers	109
Begründung einer strengen Implikation. By WILHELM ACKERMAN	113
On the definition of ‘formal deduction’. By RICHARD MONTAGUE and LEON HENKIN	129
On the interpretation of Aristotelian syllogistic. By J. C. SHEPHERDSON	137
On formulas with valid cases. By W. V. QUINE	148
A new approach to semantics – Part II. By JOHN G. KEMENY	149
Arithmetical representation of recursively enumerable sets. By RAPHAEL M. ROBINSON	162
Reviews	187
Problems in symbolic logic	215
Twentieth meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic. By G. D. W. BERRY	216
Abstract of papers	216
Elections	223
Notice of a meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic	224
Identity, variables, and impredicative definitions. By K. JAAKKO J. HINTIKKA	225

On ω -consistency and related properties. By STEVEN OREY	246
On simplifying truth-functional formulas. By KURT BING	253
Independent axiom schemata for S5. By ALAN ROSS ANDERSON	255
The representations of S5. By GUSTAV BERGMANN	257
Note on a system of Myhill. By J. C. SHEPHERDSON	261
A note on transfinite iteration. By GIDEON SCHWARZ	265
Unification of universes in set theory. By W. V. QUINE	267
On the relative consistency of set theory. By STEVEN OREY	280
Some proofs of independence in axiomatic set theory. By ELLIOTT MENDELSON	291
On completely recursively enumerable classes and their key arrays By H. G. RICE	304
Reviews	309
Recursive functions in basic logic. By FREDERIC B. FITCH	337
Alternative postulate sets for Lewis's S5. By E. J. LEMMON	347
The independence of a weak axiom of choice. By ELLIOTT MENDELSON	350
Reviews	367
Institutional contributing subscribers to the Journal	414
List of officers and members of the Association for Symbolic Logic	415

ERRATA

VOLUME 21

- Page 36, line 14. For «variagles», read «variables».
- Page 49, after the last displayed formula, insert a «I» at the right margin.
- Page 51, line 5 from below. For «PRESSBURGER», read «PRESBURGER».
- Page 69, line 15 from below. Insert a left-hand paranthesis immediately after the left-hand bracket.
- Page 70, line 14, For «ca», read «ca».
- Page 73, line 8. For « $a = b$ », read « $\alpha = \beta$ ».
- Page 74, line 19. For « $\alpha = \beta$ », read « $\alpha \equiv \beta$ ».
- Page 77, line 14. Insert an additional parenthesis after «XXI 79(4)».
- Page 98, line 10 from below. For «suchthat», read «such that».
- Page 98, line 12 from below. For «generalre cursive», read «general recursive».
- Page 100. line 11. For «contra productive», read «contraproductive».
- Page 102, Line 8, For «as equence», read «a sequence».
- Page 102, line 12. For «hyper-simple», read «hypersimple».
- Page 105, line 6 from below. For «112», read «109».
- Page 107, line 1. For «clasica», read «clásica».
- Page 107, line 11. Insert a comma after 0.
- Page 107, line 17. For «1951», read «1952».
- Page 110, Line 11. For «principal», read «principle».
- Page 206, line 3 from below. For $(x\exists)$, read $(\exists x)$.
- Page 211, line 21. For «ceruits», read «circuits».
- Page 213, line 22. For «Re- printed», read «Reprinted».
- Page 219, line 5 from below. For «““yellow””», read «“ “yellow” ”».
- Page 315, line 16 from below. For «intitation», read «initiation».
- Page 319, line 2. For $(\exists R)/(S)$, read $(\exists R)(S)$.
- Page 323, line 21. Before «1949», insert «Paris».
- Page 329, line 14 from below. For «precedure», read «procedure».
- Page 330. At the end of line 2 from the bottom. For «clauses», read «clause».
- Page 331, line 2. For «latter», read «letter».
- Page 335, line 3 from the bottom. For «is», read «in».
- Page 336, line 16 from below. Insert a period after “Taxonomy”.