

# Metaphysics

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplement: 82



Edited by Anthony O'Hear

# Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements

The Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements are published twice a year. Institutional subscribers to the journal *Philosophy* receive the supplements as part of their subscription. The following supplements are available to purchase as books.

Volume 39	1995	Karl Popper: Philosophy and Problems	(ISBN 0521558158)
40	1996	Philosophy and Pluralism	(ISBN 0521567505)
41	1996	<i>Verstehen and Human Understanding</i>	(ISBN 0521587425)
42	1997	Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521587417)
43	1998	Current Issues in Philosophy of Mind	(ISBN 0521639271)
44	1999	German Philosophy since Kant	(ISBN 0521667828)
45	1999	Philosophy and Public Affairs	(ISBN 0521667844)
46	2000	Logic, Cause & Action	(ISBN 0521785103)
47	2000	Philosophy, the Good, the True and the Beautiful	(ISBN 0521785111)
48	2001	Philosophy at the New Millennium	(ISBN 0521005086)
49	2001	Naturalism, Evolution and Mind	(ISBN 0521003733)
50	2002	Time, Reality & Experience	(ISBN 0521529670)
51	2002	Logic, Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521529662)
52	2003	Philosophy and the Emotions	(ISBN 0521537347)
53	2003	Minds and Persons	(ISBN 0521537339)
54	2004	Modern Moral Philosophy	(ISBN 0521603269)
55	2004	Agency and Action	(ISBN 0521603560)
56	2005	Philosophy, Biology and Life	(ISBN 0521678455)
57	2005	The Philosophy of Need	(ISBN 0521678447)
58	2006	Political Philosophy	(ISBN 0521695597)
59	2006	Preferences and Well-Being	(ISBN 0521695589)
60	2007	Narrative and Understanding Persons	(ISBN 9780521714099)
61	2007	Philosophy of Science	(ISBN 9780521718967)
62	2008	Being: Developments in Contemporary Metaphysics	(ISBN 9780521735445)
63	2008	Kant and Philosophy of Science Today	(ISBN 9780521748513)
64	2009	Epistemology	(ISBN 9780521138581)
65	2009	Conceptions of Philosophy	(ISBN 9780521138574)
66	2010	Philosophy as Therapeia	(ISBN 9780521165150)
67	2010	The Metaphysics of Consciousness	(ISBN 9780521173919)
68	2011	Philosophy and Religion	(ISBN 9781107615984)
69	2011	Philosophy and the Environment	(ISBN 9781107696075)
70	2012	Human Nature	(ISBN 9781107651975)
71	2012	Philosophy and the Arts	(ISBN 9781107661745)
72	2013	Phenomenology and Naturalism	(ISBN 9781107699052)
73	2013	Philosophy and Sport	(ISBN 9781107647695)
74	2014	Philosophical Traditions	(ISBN 9781107434486)
75	2014	Philosophical Aesthetics and the Sciences of Art	(ISBN 9781107654587)
76	2015	Mind, Self and Person	(ISBN 9781107545663)
77	2015	Supererogation	(ISBN 9781107545731)
78	2016	History of Philosophy	(ISBN 9781316626269)
79	2016	Philosophy and Museums: Essays on the Philosophy of Museums	(ISBN 9781107545670)
80	2017	Philosophy of Action	(ISBN 9781108414890)
81	2017	Religious Epistemology	(ISBN 9781108453257)

From Volume 13 onwards the Series is published by Cambridge University Press and some earlier titles are also available.

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see [www.fsc.org](http://www.fsc.org)

# Metaphysics

ROYAL INSTITUTE OF PHILOSOPHY SUPPLEMENT: 82

EDITED BY

Anthony O'Hear

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, CB2 1RP,  
United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013–2473, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
C/Orense, 4, planta 13, 28020 Madrid, Spain  
Lower Ground Floor, Nautica Building, The Water Club, Beach Road,  
Granger Bay, 8005 Cape Town, South Africa

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy and the contributors 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom at Bell and Bain Ltd.  
Typeset by Techset Composition Ltd, Salisbury, UK

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

ISBN 9781108740623

ISSN 1358-2461

# Contents

Preface	v
List of Contributors	vii
Laws for Metaphysical Explanation JONATHAN SCHAFFER	1
Irrealism about Grounding NAOMI THOMPSON	23
Against Conservatism in Metaphysics MAEGAN FAIRCHILD AND JOHN HAWTHORNE	45
Cardinals, Ordinals, and the Prospects for a Fregean Foundation ERIC SNYDER, STEWART SHAPIRO AND RICHARD SAMUELS	77
The Basis of Necessity and Possibility BOB HALE	109
Changing Metaphysics: What Difference does it Make? AMIE L. THOMASSON	139
Lady Parts: The Metaphysics of Pregnancy ELSELIJN KINGMA	165
Spaces of Possibility TIMOTHY WILLIAMSON	189
Wittgenstein on Solipsism in the 1930s: Private Pains, Private Languages, and Two Uses of 'I' TIM BUTTON	205
What is a Social Practice? SALLY HASLANGER	231
Almost Identical, Almost Innocent KATHERINE HAWLEY	249
Compatibilism, Indeterminism, and Chance PENELOPE MACKIE	265
Quantifier Variance Dissolved SUKI FINN AND OTÁVIO BUENO	289

Essence and Mere Necessity	309
JESSICA LEECH	
Towards a Hylomorphic Solution to the Grounding Problem	333
KATHRIN KOSLICKI	
Metaphysical Optimism	365
PENELOPE RUSH	
Index of Names	395

# List of Contributors

**Jonathan Schaffer** – Rutgers University

**Naomi Thompson** – University of Southampton, Göteborgs  
Universitet

**Maegan Fairchild** – University of Southern California

**John Hawthorne** – University of Southern California

**Eric Snyder** – Ohio State University

**Stewart Shapiro** – Ohio State University

**Richard Samuels** – Ohio State University

**Bob Hale** – University of Sheffield

**Amie Thomasson** – Dartmouth College

**Elselijn Kingma** – University of Southampton

**Timothy Williamson** – University of Oxford

**Tim Button** – University of Cambridge

**Sally Haslanger** – Massachusetts Institute of Technology

**Katherine Hawley** – University of St Andrews

**Penelope Mackie** – University of Nottingham

**Suki Finn** – University of Southampton

**Otávio Bueno** – University of Miami

**Jessica Leech** – King's College London

**Kathrin Koslicki** – University of Alberta

**Penelope Rush** – University of Tasmania