

# The JOURNAL of ECONOMIC HISTORY

VOLUME XLVI

JUNE 1986

NUMBER 2

THE RYLEY LIBRARY  
BOLTON INSTITUTE OF HIGHER  
EDUCATION-CHADWICK CAMPUS

## PAPERS PRESENTED AT THE FORTY-FIFTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE ECONOMIC HISTORY ASSOCIATION

ENGERMAN (Presidential Address)  
*Slavery and Emancipation in Comparative Perspective*

ROMER, *Prewar GNP and Unemployment*  
WEIR, *Comparing Cyclical Stability*  
CARTER, *Occupational Segregation and Teachers' Wages*  
ABRAMOVITZ, *Catching Up in Growth*  
GRUBB, *Redemptioner Immigration*  
BOYER, *Poor Law and Migration*  
OBERLY, *Westward Who?*  
EICHENGREEN AND GEMERY, *Immigrant Earnings*  
ESBITT, *Chicago Banks in the Great Depression*  
ATAK, *American Firm Size*  
DICK, *Consumer Behavior and Ontario Workers*

DISSERTATION SUMMARIES AND REVIEW ARTICLE

PUBLISHED BY THE ECONOMIC HISTORY ASSOCIATION  
AT  
THE UNIVERSITY OF IOWA

EDITORS  
CLAUDIA GOLDIN  
DONALD MCCLOSKEY

---

EDITORIAL STAFF

Carol Petraitis and Ginalie Swaim, *Assistant Editors*  
Kellie Mulford and Robert Whaples, *Editorial Assistants*  
Richmond D. Williams, *Business Manager*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Ralph Austen	<i>Chicago</i>
Michael Bordo	<i>South Carolina</i>
Fred Carstensen	<i>Connecticut</i>
Stephen DeCanio	<i>California, Santa Barbara</i>
Michael Edelstein	<i>Queens College</i>
Stefano Fenoaltea	<i>Swarthmore College</i>
George Grantham	<i>McGill</i>
C. Knick Harley	<i>Western Ontario</i>
Naomi Lamoreaux	<i>Brown</i>
William Lazonick	<i>Harvard</i>
Frank Lewis	<i>Queens University</i>
Gary Libecap	<i>Arizona</i>
Michelle McAlpin	<i>Tufts</i>
John McCusker	<i>Maryland</i>
Russell Menard	<i>Minnesota</i>
Joel Mokyr	<i>Northwestern</i>
J. A. Raftis	<i>Mediaeval Institute, Toronto</i>
Hugh Rockoff	<i>Rutgers</i>
Harry N. Scheiber	<i>California, Berkeley</i>
Jeffrey G. Williamson	<i>Harvard</i>
Kozo Yamamura	<i>Washington, Seattle</i>

THE JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC HISTORY is published in March, June, September, and December by The Economic History Association at The University of Iowa. The JOURNAL is sent to all members of the Association. Membership rates are: student membership, \$8.00; regular membership, United States, \$20.00; library subscriptions, \$30.00; professors emeriti who have been members of the Association for ten years, \$10.00; life membership, \$400.00; back issues, \$5.00. Applications and inquiries concerning membership and single copies should be addressed to Secretary-Treasurer Richmond D. Williams, Hagley Museum and Library, P.O. Box 3630, Wilmington, Delaware 19807.

Articles on economic history and related aspects of history or economics will be considered for publication by the editors. Those manuscripts incorporating the results of detailed original research should include some discussion of the broader significance of the subject matter. Contributions should be typed double-spaced; tables and footnotes, also double-spaced, should be grouped separately at the end of the paper. Four copies of each manuscript should be submitted, and each manuscript should be accompanied by a statement of the approximate number of words that it contains. A submission fee of \$20.00 is required from nonmembers of The Economic History Association. Prospective contributors may obtain from the Editorial Office a copy of "Suggestions to Contributors," a list of the major literary and stylistic customs of the JOURNAL.

The JOURNAL does not accept unsolicited book reviews, nor does it honor individuals' requests to review particular works. Reviews are indexed in the *Book Review Index*.

Manuscripts to be considered for publication in the JOURNAL and books for review should be sent to The Editors, JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC HISTORY, 215 Schaeffer Hall, University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa 52242.

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ECONOMIC HISTORY ASSOCIATION  
AT THE UNIVERSITY OF IOWA

BUSINESS OFFICE: HAGLEY MUSEUM AND LIBRARY,  
P.O. BOX 3630, WILMINGTON, DELAWARE 19807

Second Class Postage Paid at Wilmington, Delaware and at Additional Mailing Offices  
Copyright 1985 by The Economic History Association  
Printed in the U.S.A. by The William Byrd Press, Inc.  
(ISSN 0022-0507)  
(USPS-279580)

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to The Economic  
History Association, P.O. Box 3630, Wilmington, Delaware 19807

THE JOURNAL  
OF ECONOMIC HISTORY

---

THE TASKS OF ECONOMIC HISTORY

Volume XLVI

June 1986

Number 2

PAPERS PRESENTED AT THE FORTY-FIFTH ANNUAL  
MEETING OF THE ECONOMIC HISTORY ASSOCIATION

- STANLEY L. ENGERMAN (Presidential Address)  
*Slavery and Emancipation in Comparative Perspective: A Look at  
Some Recent Debates* 317
- CHRISTINA ROMER  
*New Estimates of Prewar Gross National Product and  
Unemployment* 341
- DAVID R. WEIR  
*The Reliability of Historical Macroeconomic Data for Comparing  
Cyclical Stability* 353
- Discussion: STANLEY LEBERGOTT 367
- SUSAN B. CARTER  
*Occupational Segregation, Teachers' Wages, and American  
Economic Growth* 373
- MOSES ABRAMOVITZ  
*Catching Up, Forging Ahead, and Falling Behind* 385
- FARLEY GRUBB  
*Redemptioner Immigration to Pennsylvania: Evidence on Contract  
Choice and Profitability* 407
- GEORGE R. BOYER  
*The Poor Law, Migration, and Economic Growth* 419
- JAMES W. OBERLY  
*Westward Who? Estimates of Native White Interstate Migration After  
the War of 1812* 431
- BARRY EICHENGREEN AND HENRY A. GEMERY  
*The Earnings of Skilled and Unskilled Immigrants at the End of the  
Nineteenth Century* 441

<b>MILTON ESBITT</b> <i>Bank Portfolios and Bank Failures During the Great Depression: Chicago</i>	455
<b>JEREMY ATACK</b> <i>Firm Size and Industrial Structure in the United States During the Nineteenth Century</i>	463
<b>TREVOR J. O. DICK</b> <i>Consumer Behavior in the Nineteenth Century and Ontario Workers, 1885–1889</i>	477

### SUMMARIES OF DOCTORAL DISSERTATIONS

<b>DONALD HOKE</b> <i>Ingenious Yankees, The Rise of the American System of Manufactures in the Private Sector</i>	489
<b>KENNETH SNOWDEN</b> <i>Three Essays on the American Capital Market, 1870–1913</i>	491
<b>CHRISTINA ROMER</b> <i>The Instability of the Prewar Economy Reconsidered: A Critical Examination of Historical Macroeconomic Data</i>	494
<b>GORDON BOYCE</b> <i>The Growth and Dissolution of a Large-Scale Business Enterprise: The Furness Interest, 1892–1919</i>	496
<b>GREGORY CLARK</b> <i>British Labor in Britain's Decline</i>	498
<b>MARY MACKINNON</b> <i>Poverty and Policy: The English Poor Law, 1860–1910</i>	500
<b>Discussion: W. ELLIOT BROWNLEE AND MICHAEL     EDELSTEIN</b>	503

### REVIEW ARTICLE

<b>JON S. COHEN</b> <i>Marxism in a Nutshell</i>	515
---	-----

<b>EDITORS' NOTES</b>	521
-----------------------	-----

### REVIEWS OF BOOKS

#### MODERN EUROPE

<b>SNELL.</b> <i>Annals of the Labouring Poor: Social Change and Agrarian England, 1660–1900</i>	A. Kussmaul	526
<b>BERG.</b> <i>The Age of Manufactures: Industry, Innovation and Work in Britain, 1700–1820</i>	C. K. Hyde	527
<b>ROSE, Ed.</b> <i>The Poor and the City: The English Poor Law in its Urban Context, 1834–1914</i>	M. MacKinnon	529

HARRISON AND ZEITLIN, Eds. <i>Divisions of Labour: Skilled Workers and Technological Change in Nineteenth Century England</i>	G. Clark	530
PENN. <i>Skilled Workers in the Class Structure</i>	G. Clark	530
CAIRNCROSS AND EICHENGREEN. <i>Sterling in Decline: The Devaluations of 1931, 1949 and 1967</i>	D. E. Moggridge	532
BEIK. <i>Absolutism and Society in Seventeenth-Century France: State Power and Provincial Aristocracy in Languedoc</i>	P. T. Hoffman	533
KAPLAN. <i>Provisioning Paris: Merchants and Millers in the Grain and Flour Trade during the Eighteenth Century</i>	J. M. Price	534
SUSSMAN. <i>Selling Mother's Milk: The Wet-Nursing Business in France, 1715–1914</i>	A. C. Meyering	536
HOFFMAN. <i>The Sources of Mortality Changes in Italy since Unification</i>	M. R. Haines	537
LOCKE. <i>The End of Practical Man: Entrepreneurship and Higher Education in Germany, France, and Great Britain, 1880–1940</i>	P. M. Hohenberg	539
WEXLER. <i>The Marshall Plan Revisited: The European Recovery Program in Economic Perspective</i>	S. J. Linz	540
BOVYKIN. <i>Formirovanie finansovogo kapitala v Rossii: Konets XIX v.–1908 g.</i>	P. R. Gregory	541

#### ASIA, AFRICA, OCEANIA, AND LATIN AMERICA

DENOON. <i>Settler Capitalism: The Dynamics of Dependent Development in the Southern Hemisphere</i>	J. Hogendorn	544
MHONE. <i>The Political Economy of a Dual Labor Market in Africa: The Copper Industry and Dependency in Zambia, 1929–1969</i>	J. Hogendorn	545
MOSLEY. <i>The Settler Economies: Studies in the Economic History of Kenya and Southern Rhodesia, 1900–1963</i>	J. Hogendorn	545
MCALPIN. <i>Subject to Famine: Food Crises and Economic Change in Western India, 1860–1920</i>	P. Greenough	547
BAKER. <i>An Indian Rural Economy, 1880–1955: The Tamilnad Countryside</i>	M. B. McAlpin	549
ZELIN. <i>The Magistrate's Tael: Rationalizing Fiscal Reform in Eighteenth-Century Ch'ing China</i>	T. G. Rawski	551

#### UNITED STATES AND CANADA

BODNAR. <i>The Transplanted: A History of Immigrants in Urban America</i>	S. L. Engerman	552
MAIN. <i>Society and Economy in Colonial Connecticut</i>	J. M. Price	553
BINFORD. <i>The First Suburbs: Residential Communities on the Boston Periphery, 1815–1860</i>	J. Cumbler	555
SMITH, Ed. <i>Military Enterprise and Technological Change: Perspectives on the American Experience</i>	D. J. Kevles	556
BROCK. <i>Investigation and Responsibility: Public Responsibility in the United States, 1865–1900</i>	H. G. Vatter	557
SCRANTON, Ed. <i>Silk City: Studies on the Paterson Silk Industry, 1860–1940</i>	R. Maines	558
WITTE. <i>The Politics and Development of the Federal Income Tax</i>	E. J. Ray	560
LAMOREAUX. <i>The Great Merger Movement in American Business, 1895–1904</i>	J. A. James	561

CAVANAGH AND CLAIRMONTE. <i>Alcoholic Beverages: Dimensions of Corporate Power</i>	J. M. MacDonald	563
SHINGLETON. <i>Richard Peters: Champion of the New South</i>	L. A. Carlson	564
JONES. <i>Labor of Love, Labor of Sorrow: Black Women, Work, and the Family from Slavery to the Present</i>	A. Mayhew	565
MARCUS. <i>Agricultural Science and the Quest for Legitimacy: Farmers, Agricultural Colleges, and Experiment Stations, 1870–1890</i>	A. G. Bogue	566
WUNDER, Ed. <i>Working the Range: Essays on the History of Western Land Management and the Environment</i>	G. D. Libecap	568
OLSON, Ed. <i>Historical Dictionary of the New Deal: From Inauguration to Preparation for War</i>	J. J. Wallis	569
BUSCH. <i>The War Against the Seals: A History of the North American Seal Fishery</i>	A. F. McEvoy	570
GREER. <i>Peasant, Lord and Merchant: Rural Society in Three Quebec Parishes, 1740–1840</i>	M. McInnis	571
WELLS. <i>Uncle Sam's Family: Issues in and Perspectives on American Demographic History</i>	D. S. Smith	572

#### GENERAL AND MISCELLANEOUS

PATTERSON. <i>Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study</i>	S. Fenoaltea	573
HEILBRONER. <i>The Nature and Logic of Capitalism</i>	W. W. Rostow	575
MARSHALL. <i>In Search of the Spirit of Capitalism: An Essay on Max Weber's Protestant Ethic Thesis</i>	D. C. Coleman	577
OTSUKA. <i>The Spirit of Capitalism: The Max Weber Thesis in an Economic Historical Perspective</i>	D. C. Coleman	577
JOHNS. <i>International Trade Theories and the Evolving International Economy</i>	J. R. Hanson	579
MOORE AND MOORE. <i>International Economic Indicators: A Sourcebook</i>	A. Heston	580
BYRES, Ed. <i>Sharecropping and Sharecroppers</i>	J. D. Reid	580