

ST THOMAS AQUINAS: SUMMA THEOLOGIAE: Latin Text and English Translation, Introductions, Notes, Appendices and Glossaries. Blackfriars Publications, in conjunction with Eyre and Spottiswoode.

Vol. 3 (1a, 12–13): *Knowing and Naming God*. Herbert McCabe, O.P. 30s.

Vol. 4 (1a, 14–18): *Knowledge in God*. Thomas Gornall, S.J. 30s.

Vol. 22 (1a 11ae, 49–54): *Dispositions for Human Acts*. Anthony Kenny. 30s.

The second trio of volumes of the new edition of the *Summa* in no way falls behind the first and it reveals the fact that the Dominican fathers who have planned this great enterprise have broad-mindedly decided not to restrict its execution to members of their own order. As with the earlier volumes, the printing of the Latin text opposite the English translation has made it possible for the latter to be cast in a much more idiomatic, and, it may be added, a much more readable, form than would have been practicable if the original was not immediately available for comparison. One of the great delights of reading this edition comes from the way in which, time after time, some highly technical Latin phrase which one has been accustomed to render by some artificial English equivalent finds perfect expression in some quite colloquial form of words. In a translation of this kind, in which each of the collaborators has clearly been encouraged to follow his own line, complete uniformity is, of course, unattainable, nor would it be desirable. It is, for example, both entertaining and illuminating to compare the renderings of the same phrase or the definitions of the same term in the text and glossaries of successive volumes. All this, one feels, is just what the Angelic Doctor himself would approve; to take an instance, Fr Gornall, S.J., is rather less exuberant in his translation than Fr McCabe, O.P., who (with no attempt at concealment) supplies his own set of analogates in reproducing St Thomas's famous example of the analogical character of the concept of health and replaces St Thomas's false etymology of

*lapis* by a correct etymology of 'hydrogen'.

Volumes 3 and 4, dealing respectively with our knowledge of God and with God's knowledge of himself and of everything else, continue the theme of the first two volumes. The reader will not find here the numerous and voluminous appendices that Volumes 1 and 2 contained; Fr McCabe gives four short ones, Fr Gornall none at all. But this is no doubt because the material which Fr McDermott and Fr Gilby provided for Volume 2 includes most of what is needed for Volumes 3 and 4 as well; and the special assistance which the reader of the latter requires is amply displayed in the introductions and glossaries and in unobtrusive but very informative footnotes. Some readers will no doubt regret that Fr McCabe says so little about St Thomas's teaching on analogy, while respecting his opinion that in the past too much has been made of it. I may perhaps be allowed to draw attention to the recent work of Père B. Montagnes, O.P., *La Doctrine de l'analogie de l'être d'après S. Thomas d'Aquin*, in which it is argued that in his *Commentary on the Sentences* St Thomas conceived the relation between God and creatures in terms of analogy of attribution, then in the *De Veritate*, being conscious of the danger of univocity, adopted analogy of proportionality and wrote in terms of form and exemplarism, and finally, in the *Contra Gentes*, the *De Potentia* and the *Prima Pars*, lost his fears, wrote in terms of act and efficiency and returned to analogy of attribution.

Dr Kenny's volume, which embodies St Thomas's teaching on human dispositions or *habitus*,

confronted the translator with problems which he has skilfully surmounted. As he himself remarks, this treatise, if taken out of its context, is a work of philosophy not of theology, and seems to be an *ad hoc* composition which 'modestly pretends to be more Aristotelian than it really is'. While maintaining that its philosophical conclusions are of more than antiquarian interest, he recognizes that these are not easy to disentangle from their 'antique apparatus'; he therefore writes his introduction from a thoroughly modern standpoint, provides thirteen appendices explaining various technicalities of the Thomist metaphysics and psychology and gives a large number of footnotes dealing with incidental points of terminology and theory. Like Fr Hill in Volume 13 he admits the inadequacy of St Thomas's scientific knowledge (here, of course, in the realm of psychology), and when he thinks that the Angelic Doctor misses the point he does not hesitate to say so. All the time he has the fashionable linguistic philosophers clearly in mind and against

their background he makes the fundamental soundness of St Thomas's teaching stand out plainly. While making one passing reference to Professor Gilbert Ryle, he leaves us to infer for ourselves the contrast between the doctrine of dispositions in *The Concept of Mind* and that in the *Prima Secundae*. By a skilful examination of the various contexts he concludes that the most adequate English equivalent of *habitus* is not 'habit' but 'disposition' and that the most adequate English equivalent of *dispositio* is not 'disposition' but 'state'. It is perhaps an indication of the special difficulties that are presented by this treatise that the reader is warned in an editorial note that Dr Kenny's views are in some cases not shared by the editorial board and other collaborators.

As with the earlier volumes, paper, printing and binding are of the highest quality, and the price, judged by present-day standards, is by no means excessive.

E. L. Mascall

THE THEOLOGY OF THE SACRAMENTS AND OTHER PAPERS, by D. M. Baillie; *Faber Paper Covered Editions*, 9s. 6d.

WHAT IS A SACRAMENT? by Bernard Piault, translated by A. Manson; A Faith and Fact Book, *Burns and Oates*, 9s. 6d.

BAPTISM AND CONFIRMATION, by Burkhard Neunheuser, O.S.B., translated by John Jay Hughes; Herder History of Dogma, *Burns and Oates*, 42s.

TERTULLIAN'S HOMILY ON BAPTISM, text edited with an introduction, translation and commentary by Ernest Evans; *S.P.C.K.*, 35s.

BAPTISM IN THE NEW TESTAMENT, a symposium by A. George, S.M., and others, translated by David Askew; *Geoffrey Chapman*, 25s.

*The Theology of the Sacraments* is a series of talks delivered by the late Professor D. M. Baillie in 1952. They are an attempt by a Presbyterian theologian to rethink some of the traditional positions of reformed theology in the light of

modern research and of such ideas as the sacramental nature of the universe, the place of the sacraments in sacred history and their eschatological dimension. Even by those who do not share his tradition Dr Baillie's book will be found