

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVI NUMBERS 1 & 2 1990

THE HARVARD MODEL AIDS LEGISLATION PROJECT

Special Editors:

Larry Gostin

William Curran

Project Authors:

Mary E. Clark

Harold Edgar

Martha A. Field

Daniel M. Fox

Hazel Sandomire

NOTE: ETHICS AND AIDS

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$45.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$25.00 for foreign postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$13 (includes postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$95.00 for 1990). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in LEXIS, WESTLAW, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Contents, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JON WESTLING, B.A., *President ad interim*

JOSEPH BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Dean ad interim and Professor of Law*

CLAYTON P. GILLETTE, B.A., J.D. *Associate Dean*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

DANIEL FREEHLING, B.A., M.S., *Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., *President*

BERNARD M. DICKENS, Ph.D., LL.D., *President-Elect*

CHRISTINE MITCHELL, R.N., M.S., M.T.S., *Secretary*

GEORGE J. ANNAS, J.D., M.P.H., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, LL.B., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

**FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**
John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS
American Society of Law & Medicine
Merrill Kaitz

CIRCULATION MANAGER
Susan Reddy

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.
Nutter, McClennen & Fish
Hyannis, Massachusetts

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Powers & Hall
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Department of Preventive Medicine
Medical College of Wisconsin

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.
University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.
Wildman, Harold Allen & Dickson
Chicago, Illinois

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.
Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.
Director, Program on Science Technology
and Society
Cornell University

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

**Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,
F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**
Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Honorable Max Rosenn
United States Court of Appeals for the
Third Circuit

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Founder, American Society of
Law & Medicine
Harvard Medical School

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Special Assistant to the President
Tufts University

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

Paul R. Trembley
Boston College Law School

David G. Warren, J.D.
Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael J. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeals
Supreme Court
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical
Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

P.D.G. Skegg
Dean of Law
University of Otago
Dunedin
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVI NUMBERS 1 & 2 1990

**BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1989-1990**

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Mark Cheffo

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Pamela D. Harvey

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Liane Cohen

MANAGING EDITOR

Robert G. Bannish

PROJECTS EDITOR

James W. Tegtmeier

ARTICLES EDITORS

Andrea de Gorgey

Stephen Freeland

Daniel Gindes

Leopold J. Luberecki, Jr.

**ASSISTANT
SYMPOSIUM EDITOR**

Susan Tribble

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Rachel Fishman

Wayne S. Flick

Michael C. Fondo

Miriam Kelliher

William A. Kraiss

Joan Lieberman

Allison C. Linneman

Barbara A. Masterson

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Joan Andres

David Baum

David J. Breen

Karyn Finamore

Allen Glass

Anne Marie Jennings

Stephen P. Kelly

Marie Lavalleye

Linda Mesler

Laurie E. Meyers

Stephen B. Monick

James Nealon

Deborah A. Savarese

Meredith Skinner

Pamela L. Taylor

STAFF MEMBERS

Evan Ackiron

Michael Adlin

Daniel Alcott

Marian Baldwin

Michael R.B. Balfe

Michael Borruso

Scott Brown

Kimberle Bruckno

Tim Busler

Richard A. Calame

Sally L. Davis

Michael Flynn

Randy Frisch

Carolann F.J. Hanselman

Joseph Hardcastle

Kenneth Joel

Andrew Kim

Anne Marie LaBue

Karen Levin

Suzanne D.T. Lovett

Nancy Lubin

Mark Mantooth

Michele L. Miller

Rebecca Morrissey

Heidi Poreda

Robert H. Rieders

Julie Rissman

Giselle Samuely

Wendy L. Schoen

Lynn A. Schweinfurth

Marc I. Seltzer

Webb Steadman

Terry Nicole Steinberg

Laura Sweeney

Mi Jung Yoon

David G. Yu

Special thanks to Jennifer Smith, Publications Assistant

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael J. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeals
Supreme Court
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical
Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

P.D.G. Skegg
Dean of Law
University of Otago
Dunedin
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVI NUMBERS 1 & 2 1990

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1989-1990

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Mark Cheffo

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Pamela D. Harvey

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Liane Cohen

MANAGING EDITOR

Robert G. Bannish

PROJECTS EDITOR

James W. Tegtmeier

ARTICLES EDITORS

Andrea de Gorgey

Stephen Freeland

Daniel Gindes

Leopold J. Luberecki, Jr.

ASSISTANT SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Susan Tribble

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Rachel Fishman

Wayne S. Flick

Michael C. Fondo

Miriam Kelliher

William A. Kraiss

Joan Lieberman

Allison C. Linneman

Barbara A. Masterson

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Joan Andres

David Baum

David J. Breen

Karyn Finamore

Allen Glass

Anne Marie Jennings

Stephen P. Kelly

Marie Lavalleye

Linda Mesler

Laurie E. Meyers

Stephen B. Monick

James Nealon

Deborah A. Savarese

Meredith Skinner

Pamela L. Taylor

STAFF MEMBERS

Evan Ackiron

Michael Adlin

Daniel Alcott

Marian Baldwin

Michael R.B. Balfe

Michael Borruso

Scott Brown

Kimberle Bruckno

Tim Busler

Richard A. Calame

Sally L. Davis

Michael Flynn

Randy Frisch

Carolann F.J. Hanselman

Joseph Hardcastle

Kenneth Joel

Andrew Kim

Anne Marie LaBue

Karen Levin

Suzanne D.T. Lovett

Nancy Lubin

Mark Mantooth

Michele L. Miller

Rebecca Morrissey

Heidi Poreda

Robert H. Rieders

Julie Rissman

Giselle Samuely

Wendy L. Schoen

Lynn A. Schweinfurth

Marc I. Seltzer

Webb Steadman

Terry Nicole Steinberg

Laura Sweeney

Mi Jung Yoon

David G. Yu

Special thanks to Jennifer Smith, Publications Assistant

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVI NUMBERS 1 & 2 1990

THE HARVARD MODEL AIDS LEGISLATION PROJECT

ARTICLES

PREFACE

- | | | |
|---|-----|---------------------------------|
| A DECADE OF A MATURING
EPIDEMIC: AN ASSESSMENT AND
DIRECTIONS FOR FUTURE PUBLIC
POLICY | 1 | Larry Gostin |
| TESTING FOR AIDS: USES AND
ABUSES | 33 | Martha A. Field |
| AIDS PREVENTION: LEGISLATIVE
OPTIONS | 107 | Mary E. Clark |
| MEDICAL PRIVACY ISSUES IN THE
AGE OF AIDS: LEGISLATIVE
OPTIONS | 155 | Harold Edgar
Hazel Sandomire |
| FINANCING HEALTH CARE FOR
PERSONS WITH HIV INFECTION:
GUIDELINES FOR STATE ACTION | 223 | Daniel M. Fox |

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- | | |
|---|-----|
| ETHICS AND AIDS: A SUMMARY OF
THE LAW AND A CRITICAL
ANALYSIS OF THE INDIVIDUAL
PHYSICIAN'S ETHICAL DUTY TO
TREAT | 249 |
|---|-----|

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- | | |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS | 267 |
| SELECTED BOOK RELEASES | 277 |

Copyright 1990 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.