

# CHURCH HISTORY

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY, DECEMBER, 1996

# THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

## *PRESIDENT*

BARBARA BROWN ZIKMUND, Hartford Seminary

## *PRESIDENT-ELECT*

RICHARD KIECKHEFER, Northwestern University

## *SECRETARY-TREASURER*

HENRY W. BOWDEN, Rutgers University

## *ASSISTANT SECRETARY*

MELISSA B. KIRKPATRICK, The American University

## *EDITORS*

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

## *MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL*

### *Class of 1996*

JEREMY ADAMS  
PHYLLIS D. AIRHART  
DAVID L. HOLMES  
RICHARD KIECKHEFER  
JON ROBERTS

### *Class of 1997*

ROBERT GREGG  
CHARLES H. LIPPY  
LAURIE MAFFLY-KIPP  
RUSSELL RICHEY  
GROVER ZINN

### *Class of 1998*

LEWIS V. BALDWIN  
MARY F. BEDNAROWSKI  
RALPH KEEN  
MARK R. VALERI  
REBECCA H. WEAVER

The Society was founded in 1888 by Philip Schaff, was reorganized in 1906, and was incorporated by act of the Legislature of the State of New York in 1916.

Vol. 65      December 1996      No. 4

# CHURCH HISTORY

Published quarterly by  
THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

© 1996, The American Society of Church History

## CHURCH HISTORY EDITORS

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

*with the cooperation of*

JON BUTLER (1997), Yale University  
ELIZABETH CLARK (1997), Duke University  
JAY DOLAN (1996), University of Notre Dame  
E. BROOKS HOLIFIELD (1998), Emory University  
BERNARD MCGINN (1998), The Divinity School, University of Chicago  
LEIGH E. SCHMIDT (1997), Princeton University

*assistants to the editors*

DANIEL P. BUCHANAN  
R. JONATHAN MOORE

*Church History* is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by the American Society of Church History. Membership prices are \$40.00 a year (persons having been society members for five years and now retired from professional life—\$20.00; dues free for graduate students with the approval of a professor who is a member of the Society). Subscriptions are \$50.00; \$10.00 for single issues; \$10.00 per year extra should be added for foreign countries. Please make all remittances payable to the American Society of Church History. Subscription applications, renewals, changes of address, claims for missing numbers, and orders for single copies of current or back issues should be sent to Henry W. Bowden, P.O. Box 8517, Red Bank, NJ 07701. Claims for missing numbers will be honored without charge if made within two months following the regular month of publication.

Microfilm reproductions of *The American Society of Church History Papers*, series I and II, and of *Church History*, vols. 1–17 (1932–48), are available from the ATLA Preservation Board. Orders for these reproductions as well as inquiries about microfilm portions and xerox copies should be sent to 1118 East 54th Place, Chicago, Illinois 60615.

Microfilm reproductions of *Church History* starting with vol. 18 (1949) are available to subscribers and members of the society from University Microfilms, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106. The full text of *Church History* is also available in the electronic versions of the *Humanities Index*. *Church History* is indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*, *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*, *Religion Indexes: RIO/RIT/IBRR 1975– on CD-ROM*, and *ATLA Religion Database on CD-ROM*, all published by the American Theological Association, 820 Church St., Evanston, IL 60201-5613; e-mail [atla@atla.com](mailto:atla@atla.com); www:<http://atla.library.vanderbilt.edu/atla/home.html>.

The following indexes are available from the treasurer, Henry W. Bowden, at the address given above: *Papers* and vols. 31–39 (1962–1970), \$10.00; vols. 40–49 (1971–1980), \$10.00 (\$8.00 for active, individual members of the Society). Add \$2.00 postage charges. Book reviews are indexed or abstracted in *Book Review Index*, *Historical Abstracts*, and *America: History and Life*.

Manuscripts and books for review should be sent to *Church History*, Swift Hall, 1025 E. 58th St., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Manuscripts submitted for consideration must be typed double-spaced in 12-point font on sturdy paper; *footnotes must be typed double-spaced* on separate pages following the text. Manuscripts exceeding twenty-five pages in length (including footnotes) cannot be considered. Please submit two copies of the manuscript and include correct return postage. Do not send a diskette.

Advertising orders and requests for permission to quote should be addressed to the editorial office in Chicago.

*Church History* is printed by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Periodicals postage paid at Red Bank, New Jersey and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send Address Changes to: Church History, American Society of Church History, Henry W. Bowden, P.O. Box 8517, Red Bank, NJ 07701.

CHURCH HISTORY (ISSN 0009-6407)

# CONTENTS

577 The Spiritual Pilgrimage of Rachel Stearns, 1834–1837:  
Reinterpreting Women’s Religious and Social Experiences in the  
Methodist Revivals of Nineteenth-Century America  
CANDY GUNTHER

596 The Alleged Abduction of Milly McPherson and Catholic  
Recruitment of Presbyterian Girls  
C. WALKER GOLLAR

599 Some Scripture Is Inspired by God: Late-Nineteenth-Century  
Protestants and the Demise of a Common Bible  
PETER J. THUESEN

524 Father Mathew’s Disciples: American Catholic Support for  
Temperance, 1840–1920  
JOHN F. QUINN

541 Messianism, Holiness, Charisma, and Community: The  
American-Swedish Colony in Jerusalem, 1881–1933  
YAAKOV ARIEL AND RUTH KARK

## 558 Book Reviews

Wallis, Ian G., <i>The Faith of Jesus Christ in Early Christian Traditions</i> .....	T. Hall Partrick
Rankin, David, <i>Tertullian and the Church</i> .....	Everett Ferguson
Brent, Allen, <i>Hippolytus and the Roman Church in the Third Century: Communities in Tension Before the Emergence of a Monarch-Bishop</i> .....	Robert M. Grant
Widdicombe, Peter, <i>The Fatherhood of God from Origen to Athanasius</i> .....	Alan Kolp
Williams, Stephen, and Gerard Friell, <i>Theodosius: The Empire at Bay</i> .....	Thomas F. X. Noble
MacMullen, Ramsay, <i>Changes In The Roman Empire: Essays In The Ordinary</i> .....	William D. Carpe
Gamble, Harry Y., <i>Books and Readers in the Early Church: A History of Early Christian Texts</i> .....	Frederick W. Norris
Mühlenberg, Ekkehard, and Johannes van Oort, eds., <i>Predigt in der Alten Kirche</i> .....	James A. Patrick
Sumruld, William A., <i>Augustine and the Arians: The Bishop of Hippo’s Encounters with Ulfilan Arianism</i> .....	Eugene TeSelle
Lim, Richard, <i>Public Disputation, Power, and Social Order in Late Antiquity</i> .....	Robert J. Hauck
Henn, William, O.F.M. Cap., <i>One Faith: Biblical and Patristic Contributions Toward Understanding Unity in Faith</i> .....	Bradley Nassif
Lapidge, Michael, ed., <i>Archbishop Theodore: Commemorative Studies on His Life and Influence</i> .....	W. Trent Foley

Rabe, Susan A., <i>Faith, Art, and Politics at Saint-Riquier: The Symbolic Vision of Angilbert</i> .....	Joseph F. Kelly
McKitterick, Rosamond, ed., <i>The New Cambridge Medieval History</i> , vol. 2, c. 700–c. 900 .....	Carl A. Volz
Davril, Anselme, O.S.B., ed., <i>The Winchcombe Sacramentary</i> .....	John B. Wickstrom
Gameson, Richard, <i>The Role of Art in the Late Anglo-Saxon Church</i> .....	Richard W. Pfaff
Rando, Daniela, <i>Una Chiesa di Frontiera: le istituzioni ecclesiastiche veneziane nei secoli VI–XII</i> .....	Thomas F. X. Noble
Bolton, Brenda, <i>Innocent III: Studies on Papal Authority and Pastoral Care</i> .....	Glenn W. Olsen
Turner, Denys, <i>Eros and Allegory: Medieval Exegesis of the Song of Songs</i> .....	Kevin Madigan
Dyson, R. W., ed. and trans., <i>James of Viterbo: On Christian Government (De regimine Christiano)</i> .....	John E. Lynch
English, Edward D., ed., <i>Reading and Wisdom: The De Doctrina Christiana of Augustine in the Middle Ages</i> .....	George S. Robbert
Maguire, Henry, ed., <i>Byzantine Magic</i> .....	Demetrios J. Constantelos
Courtenay, William J., <i>Capacity and Volition: A History of the Distinction of Absolute and Ordained Power</i> .....	Joseph P. Wawrykow
Smith, Lesley, and Jane H. M. Taylor, eds., <i>Women, the Book and the Godly</i> .....	Ellen L. Babinsky
Kibler, William W., and Grover Zinn, eds., <i>Medieval France: An Encyclopedia</i> .....	Thomas F. X. Noble
Eckstein, Nicholas A., <i>The District of the Green Dragon: Neighbourhood Life and Social Change in Renaissance Florence</i> .....	Daniel Bornstein
Swanson, R. N., <i>Religion and Devotion in Europe, c. 1215–c. 1515</i> .....	Richard W. Pfaff
Wandel, Lee Palmer, <i>Voracious Idols and Violent Hands: Iconoclasm in Reformation Zurich, Strasbourg, and Basel</i> .....	Bodo Nischan
Furca, E. J., ed. and trans., <i>The Essential Carlstadt</i> .....	John H. Yoder
Domarński, Juliusz, and Lech Szczucki, eds., <i>Jacobus Palaeologus: Disputatio Scholastica</i> .....	John C. Godbey
Hamm, Berndt, Bernd Moeller, and Dorothea Wendebourg, <i>Reformationstheorien: Ein kirchenhistorischer Disput über Einheit und Vielfalt der Reformation</i> .....	Scott Hendrix
Pinilla, Ignacio J. García, ed., <i>Francisco de Enzinas: Epistolario</i> .....	Theodore M. Haggard
Kusukawa, Sachiko, <i>The Transformation of Natural Philosophy: The Case of Philip Melancthon</i> .....	Ralph Keen
Harrington, Joel F., <i>Reordering Marriage and Society in Reformation Germany</i> .....	Robert M. Kingdon
McGinness, Frederick J., <i>Right Thinking and Sacred Oratory in Counter-Reformation Rome</i> .....	Joseph P. Byrne
Diefendorf, Barbara B., <i>Beneath the Cross: Catholics and Huguenots in Sixteenth Century Paris</i> .....	Charmarie J. Blaisdell
Bartlett, Anne Clark, et al., eds., <i>Vox Mystica: Essays on Medieval Mysticism in Honor of Professor Valerie M. Lagorio</i> .....	Paul Lachance, O.F.M.
Slade, Carole, <i>St. Teresa of Avila: Author of a Heroic Life</i> .....	Keith J. Egan
Ardolino, Frank, <i>Apocalypse &amp; Armada in Kyd's Spanish Tragedy</i> .....	Richard L. Greaves
Thorp, Malcolm R., and Arthur J. Slavin, eds., <i>Politics, Religion, &amp; Diplomacy in Early Modern Europe: Essays in Honor of De Lamar Jensen</i> .....	W. Fred Graham
Wilcox, Catherine M., <i>Theology and Women's Ministry in Seventeenth-Century English Quakerism: Handmaidens of the Lord</i> .....	H. Larry Ingle
Luxon, Thomas H., <i>Literal Figures: Puritan Allegory and the Reformation Crisis of Representation</i> .....	W. Clark Gilpin

- Davis, Natalie Zemon, *Women on the Margins: Three Seventeenth Century Lives* ..... Charmarie J. Blaisdell
- Offutt, William M., Jr., *Of "Good Laws" and "Good Men": Law and Society in the Delaware Valley, 1680–1710* ..... J. William Frost
- Marissen, Michael, *The Social and Religious Designs of J. S. Bach's Brandenburg Concertos* ..... Paul Westermeyer
- Woodbridge, John D., *Revolt in Prerevolutionary France: The Prince de Conti's Conspiracy against Louis XV, 1755–1757* ..... John B. Guarino
- Morris, William Sparkes, *The Young Jonathan Edwards: A Reconstruction* ..... John Canup
- Morimoto, Anri, *Jonathan Edwards and the Catholic Vision of Salvation* ..... Joseph Conforti
- Schneider, Robert A., *The Ceremonial City: Toulouse Observed, 1738–1780* ..... James P. Gaffey
- Anastalpo, George, *The Amendments to The Constitution: A Commentary* ..... Robert S. Michaelsen
- Felsenstein, Frank, *Anti-Semitic Stereotypes: A Paradigm of Otherness in English Popular Culture, 1660–1830* ..... R. Barry Lewis
- Pelikan, Jaroslav, *Faust the Theologian* ..... Richard Erich Schade
- Sullivan, Mary C., R.S.M., *Catherine McAuley and the Tradition of Mercy* ..... Paula M. Kane
- Gardner, Robert G., *A Decade of Debate and Division: Georgia Baptists and the Formation of the Southern Baptist Convention* ..... Rosalie Beck
- Mintz, Steven, *Moralists and Modernizers: America's Pre-Civil War Reformers* ..... Robert H. Abzug
- Baird, William, *History of New Testament Research, vol. 1, From Deism to Tübingen* ..... Darrell Jodock
- Wilhelmsen, Alexandra, *La Formación del Pensamiento Político del Carlismo (1810–1875)* ..... Jaime R. Vidal
- Fisk, William Lyons, *The Scottish High Church Tradition in America: An Essay in Scotch-Irish Ethnoreligious History* ..... Leigh Eric Schmidt
- Bartholomew, Rebecca, *Audacious Women: Early British Mormon Immigrants* ..... Susan Curtis
- Graham, Stephen R., *Cosmos in the Chaos: Philip Schaff's Interpretation of Nineteenth-Century American Religion* ..... E. Brooks Holifield
- Woolverton, John F., *The Education of Phillips Brooks* ..... Robert Bruce Mullin
- Paz, D. G., ed., *Nineteenth-Century English Religious Traditions: Retrospect and Prospect* ..... Dale A. Johnson
- Choquette, Robert, *The Oblate Assault on Canada's Northwest* ..... Robert H. Keller
- Butler, Diana Hochstedt, *Standing Against The Whirlwind: Evangelical Episcopalians in Nineteenth-Century America* ..... William L. Sachs
- Murdoch, Norman H., *Origins of the Salvation Army* ..... Major John G. Merritt
- Graham, William C., *Half Finished Heaven: The Social Gospel in American Literature* ..... Susan Curtis
- Hansen, Jennifer Moulton, ed., *Letters of Catharine Cottam Romney, Plural Wife* ..... Susan Curtis
- Flegg, Columba Graham, *'Gathered Under Apostles': A Study of the Catholic Apostolic Church* ..... Robert G. Clouse
- Yohn, Susan M., *A Contest of Faiths: Missionary Women and Pluralism in the American Southwest* ..... Randi J. Walker
- Hart, D. G., *Defending the Faith: J. Gresham Machen and the Crisis of Conservative Protestantism in Modern America* ..... William Vance Trollinger, Jr.
- Fox, William L., *Willard Sperry: The Quandaries of a Liberal Protestant Mind, 1914–1939* ..... James Findlay
- Jarlet, Anders, *The Oxford Group, Group Revivalism, and the Churches in Northern Europe, 1930–1940, with Special Reference to Scandinavia and Germany* ..... Emmet E. Eklund
- Grauvogel, Gerd Wilhelm, *Theodor von Wächter: Christ und Sozialdemokrat* ..... Richard V. Pierard

- O'Toole, James M., *Militant and Triumphant: William Henry O'Connell and the Catholic Church in Boston, 1859–1944* ..... Brian Clarke
- Trollinger, William Vance, Jr., *God's Empire: William Bell Riley and Midwestern Fundamentalism* ..... Timothy P. Weber
- Nowak, Kurt, *Geschichte des Christentums in Deutschland: Religion, Politik und Gesellschaft vom Ende der Aufklärung bis zur Mitte des 20. Jahrhunderts* ..... Daniel R. Borg
- Rocca, Giancarlo, *Donne Religiose: Contributo a una storia condizione femminile in Italia nei secoli XIX–XX* ..... Peter R. D'Agostino
- Dolan, Timothy Michael, "Some Seed Fell on Good Ground": *The Life of Edwin V. O'Hara* ..... Steven M. Avella
- Alberigo, Giuseppe, ed., *History of Vatican II, vol. 1, Announcing and Preparing Vatican Council II: Toward a New Era in Catholicism* ..... John Jay Hughes
- Campbell, Stanislaus, *From Breviary to Liturgy of the Hours: The Structural Reform of the Roman Office 1964–1971* ..... John Jay Hughes
- Dorrien, Gary, *Soul in Society: The Making and Renewal of Social Christianity* ..... Paul A. Carter
- Silk, Mark, *Unsecular Media: Making News of Religion in America* ..... Charles H. Lippy
- Hart, D. G., and John Muether, *Fighting the Good Fight: A Brief History of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church* ..... George M. Marsden
- Rian, Edwin H., *The Presbyterian Conflict* ..... George M. Marsden
- McCauley, Deborah Vansau, *Appalachian Mountain Religion: A History* ..... Donald G. Mathews
- Spalding, Thomas W., *The Premier See: A History of the Archdiocese of Baltimore, 1789–1994* ..... John P. Marschall
- Turcotte, Paul-André, *Intransigence ou compromis: Sociologie et histoire du catholicisme actuel* ..... James C. Deming
- Ford, Alan, James McGuire, and Kenneth Milne, eds., *As by Law Established: The Church of Ireland Since the Reformation* ..... R. Barry Lewis
- Muir, Elizabeth Gillan, and Marilyn Färdig Whiteley, eds., *Changing Roles of Women within the Christian Church in Canada* ..... Susan Hill Lindley
- Torres, Carlos Alberto, *The Church, Society, and Hegemony: A Critical Sociology of Religion in Latin America* ..... Robert L. Breckenridge
- Fitzgerald, Thomas E., *The Orthodox Church* ..... Charles A. Frazee
- Wardin, Albert W., ed., *Baptists Around the World: A Comprehensive Handbook* ..... Eldon G. Ernst
- Auksi, Peter, *Christian Plain Style: The Evolution of a Spiritual Ideal* ..... Horton Davies
- Verstraelen, F. J., et al., eds., *Missiology: An Ecumenical Introduction. Texts and Contexts of Global Christianity* ..... James A. Scherer
- Wimbush, Vincent L., and Richard Valantasis, eds., *Asceticism* ..... David Brakke
- Wengert, Timothy J., and Charles W. Brockwell, Jr., eds., *Telling the Churches' Stories: Ecumenical Perspectives on Writing Christian History* ..... George H. Shriver
- Conforti, Joseph A., *Jonathan Edwards, Religious Tradition, and American Culture* ..... E. Brooks Holifield
- Schmidt, Leigh Eric, *Consumer Rites: The Buying and Selling of American Holidays* ..... Catherine L. Albanese
- McDannell, Colleen, *Material Christianity: Religion and Popular Culture in America* ..... Charles H. Lippy
- Hastings, Adrian, *The Church in Africa, 1450–1950* ..... Charles W. Weber