

# Israel Law Review

A journal of human rights, public and international law

Introduction – **Nigel Rodley and Yuval Shany**

Is There Ever a 'Right to One's Own Law'? An Exploration of Possible Rights Foundations for Legal Pluralism – **Frédéric Mégret**

Section IX of the ICRC Interpretive Guidance on Direct Participation in Hostilities: The End of *Jus in Bello* Proportionality as We Know It? – **Jann K Kleffner**

Do Soldiers' Lives Matter? A View from Proportionality – **Reuven (Ruvi) Ziegler and Shai Otzari**

The Principle of Proportionality: 'Force Protection' as a Military Advantage – **Robin Geiss**

Applying Necessity and Proportionality to Anti-Terrorist Self-Defence – **Christian J Tams and James G Devaney**

Proportionality under *Jus ad Bellum* and *Jus in Bello*: Clarifying their Relationship – **Raphaël van Steenberghe**

The Proportionality Principle in Operation: Methodological Limitations of Empirical Research and the Need for Transparency – **Aaron Fellmeth**

Apportioning Responsibility between the UN and Member States in UN Peace-Support Operations: An Inquiry into the Application of the 'Effective Control' Standard after *Behrami* – **Cedric Ryngaert**



מרכז מינרבה לזכויות האדם  
The Minerva Center for Human Rights  
مركز مينيرفا لحقوق الإنسان



Faculty of Law,  
The Hebrew University  
of Jerusalem

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

### EDITORS-IN-CHIEF

Sir Nigel Rodley *University of Essex, UK*  
Yuval Shany *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

### EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Danny Evron *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

### ACADEMIC EDITOR

Yaël Ronen *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

### STUDENT EDITORS

*Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Adi Atlas	Joshua Hersch
Elichai Bitter	Noa Jeselsohn
Gila Craimer	Alissa Kaduri
Izik Daniel	Shlomo Kaplan
Nimrod Dror	Ofer Kovacs
Shani Galmor	Rimone Rabinovitch
Tomer Haramaty	Yuval Shalem

### INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Professor Aharon Barak <i>Inter-Disciplinary Center, Herzliya, Israel</i>	Professor Mordechai Kremnitzer <i>Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel</i>
Professor Daphne Barak-Erez <i>Tel Aviv University, Israel</i>	Professor David Kretzmer <i>Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel</i>
Professor Malcolm Feeley <i>University of California, Berkeley, USA</i>	Professor Fionnuala Ní-Aoláin <i>University of Minnesota, USA and University of Ulster, Ireland</i>
Professor Jochen Frowein <i>Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg, Germany</i>	Professor Frances Raday <i>College of Management Academic Studies, Rishon Le Zion, Israel</i>
Professor Françoise Hampson <i>University of Essex, UK</i>	Professor William Schabas <i>Middlesex University, UK</i>
Professor Vicki Jackson <i>Harvard Law School, USA</i>	Professor Malcolm Shaw <i>University of Cambridge and Leicester University, UK</i>
Professor Michael Karayanni <i>Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel</i>	Professor Henry Steiner <i>Harvard Law School, USA</i>
Professor Eckart Klein <i>Potsdam University, Germany</i>	

Focusing on law in times of tension and conflict, the *Israel Law Review* is a leading publication in the field of human rights, public law and international law.

The *Review* is a peer-reviewed journal with a long-standing reputation for excellence, and attracts a combination of established authors and new voices writing on cutting edge topics. It is the oldest and most acclaimed Israeli law journal published in English, established in 1966.

The *Israel Law Review* is published under the auspices and management of the Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Law Faculty of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Under this stewardship, it focuses on scholarship in the fields of human rights, public law and international law. It also examines the application of legal norms under conditions of conflict and political uncertainty, highlighting the relevance of the Israeli experience in these fields to other parts of the world and that of other societies to Israel.

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

---

Volume 45

Number 1

2012

---

---

Introduction

*Nigel Rodley and Yuval Shany* ..... 1

**ARTICLES**

Is There Ever a ‘Right to One’s Own Law’? An Exploration of Possible Rights Foundations for Legal Pluralism

*Frédéric Mégret* ..... 3

Section IX of the ICRC Interpretive Guidance on Direct Participation in Hostilities: The End of *Jus in Bello* Proportionality as We Know It?

*Jann K Kleffner* ..... 35

Do Soldiers’ Lives Matter? A View from Proportionality

*Reuven (Ruvi) Ziegler and Shai Otzari* ..... 53

The Principle of Proportionality: ‘Force Protection’ as a Military Advantage

*Robin Geiss* ..... 71

Applying Necessity and Proportionality to Anti-Terrorist Self-Defence

*Christian J Tams and James G Devaney* ..... 91

Proportionality under *Jus ad Bellum* and *Jus in Bello*: Clarifying their Relationship

*Raphaël van Steenberghe* ..... 107

The Proportionality Principle in Operation: Methodological Limitations of Empirical Research and the Need for Transparency

*Aaron Fellmeth* ..... 125

Apportioning Responsibility between the UN and Member States in UN Peace-Support Operations: An Inquiry into the Application of the ‘Effective Control’ Standard after *Behrami*

*Cedric Ryngaert* ..... 151

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the very generous financial assistance provided by the P.E.F. Israel Endowment Funds, in memory of the funds' founder and first president, Judge Julian W. Mack and by the permanent endowment fund established by Abraham D. Slavitt of Norwalk, Connecticut, USA, in memory of his beloved wife, Jennie A. Slavitt. The *Israel Law Review* also gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance of the Faculty of Law, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance provided by the Minerva Foundation for the publication of the *Israel Law Review*.

Special acknowledgements are due to Phillip and Estelle Mizock Chair for the funding of 'On Richard A. Posner's Not a Suicide Pact: The Constitution in a Time of National Emergency'; and to the Faculty of Law, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the Faculty of Law, Georg-August-Universität, Göttingen for jointly funding 'Human Dignity: Comparative Perspectives'. The seminar was held with the cooperation of the Konrad Adenauer Foundation.