

might still lie in the stubble. Gleaning might now seem like wasted effort, but then it was a necessary precaution against future winter privations. Every penny counted and so every economy was worthwhile.

Miss Kitteringham has paid tribute to country work girls: the girls of long-forgotten winter days who deserve the sort of quiet memorials that Flora Thompson penned in her *Oxfordshire chronicles*. Spoken and written words are used to make us aware of the burdens that workers endured. The female servants and field labourers are possibly more shadowy and pathetic than the stereotype of 'Hodge' that grew up within the context of closed-in parish life. In writing about the system of agricultural gangs that were common in the Fen districts of East Anglia and the East Midlands, the writer turns to the Report of the Children's Employment Commission (1867), but in addition uses more direct and impressive testimony from a memoir written by a Mrs. Burrows—'A Childhood in the Fens about 1850-1860', edited by Margaret Llewelyn Davies in *Life As We have Known It* (1931).

The most detailed piece of work is Raphael Samuel's concluding essay—in five fully documented parts—on the 'Quarry roughs', the men who lived in the village of Headington Quarry from the mid-nineteenth century up to the 1920s. This area is now submerged in Oxford's suburban sprawl. Here is an essay in which the techniques of oral history have been grafted on to more usual material with much skill. The place in those early times was intriguing because it was rough, feared

by outsiders and unapproachable by authority. Dissent was strong. Methodism was the one type of religious observance to have a real grip on the community.

The self-sufficiency of Headington Quarry, Samuel suggests, is one of the reasons why it survived as a 'morrising-dancing village'. It was here in 1899 that the industrious invalid, Cecil Sharp, rediscovered 'the English morris'. The music grew up in the place itself and some of the old tunes had come down from the gypsies. A leading fiddler in the 1870s was a gypsy who 'danced in the local morris side'.

I think the heart of this research is probably to be found in the Headington Quarry transcripts and recordings made by the author a few years ago as he covered his chosen topics. When the research is finally completed all the material will be deposited in the Oxford County Museum at Woodstock. It is very suitable that a book of this experimental kind should be prefaced by Bertolt Brecht's poem, 'Questions of A Studious Working Man'. Brecht's words point to the historical blankness, to the denial of public recognition and a public identity for workers in historical records. Here are hard-won observations that bring history a little closer to common things. It will be easier for students to see connections between past and present, between local and global meanings now that we are in a time when traditional anchorages give way and communal boundaries appear to dissolve. This is the new historical approach that a new historical situation demands. E. W. MARTIN

JESUS AND THE SPIRIT, by James D. G. Dunn, *SCM Press*, 1975. xii + 515 pp. £9.50.

This is the promised sequel to Dr Dunn's *Baptism in the Holy Spirit* (SCM Press, 1970), which was subtitled 'A Re-examination of the New Testament Teaching on the Gift of the Spirit in Relation to Pentecostalism today'; now, in a book twice as big, the theme is broadened to 'A Study of the Religious and Charismatic Experience of Jesus and the First Christians as Reflected in the New Testament'. Both works spring from Dunn's long-standing concern to understand and evaluate the Pentecostal movements of this century. If

his stance is always critical, he always also shows that he finds in Pentecostalism a challenge which traditional Christianity and its New Testament exegesis must not ignore. In the earlier work Dunn showed how ill-founded in the New Testament is the doctrine that Christian regeneration normally involves two stages, that of faith sealed by water baptism and that of 'baptism in the Spirit'. Yet, like Catholic critics such as Simon Tugwell, Dunn has never wavered in his respect for the Pentecostal testimony to experience nor in his conviction

that experience is essential if Christian faith is to keep alive. In face of mistrust of the appeal to experience, whether found in the naiver forms of Protestantism or in a thinker as sophisticated as Schleiermacher (one could add, at bottom, Karl Rahner), it must be said that Dunn's thesis is true—indeed, almost a necessary truism. Without a conviction that they had experienced something radically new, Jesus's followers would not have become something new and unable, ultimately, to rest in traditional Judaism. Without a belief, however inchoate, that something actually 'happens' in the life of faith, prayer and the sacraments, people simply stop being even nominal Christians. Of the Holy Spirit, in particular, one could say that Christians accord him importance and even reality in proportion to their readiness to believe that his action can be experienced.

Thus it was timely that Dunn should go beyond earlier doctrinal-exegetical studies and attempt a systematic investigation of what the first Christians believed they experienced—and what they actually experienced. And if this was the task, how could Jesus himself be left out? Others might legitimately examine him as the 'object' of reactions, whether in terms of contemporary Judaism (as in Geza Vermes's *Jesus the Jew*) or of Christian faith. Dunn's scope could hardly omit some account of Jesus's subjective experience. In this success may well be impossible, because of the incompleteness and difficulty of the data; and behind all other problems, if Christ is the incarnate Word of God, who can get inside his subjectivity? Yet the reality of his humanity and the record of his prayer and worship surely justify the attempt, and even such a rigorously critical attempt as Dunn's.

To be rigorously critical, indeed, and exhaustively systematic, is clearly Dr Dunn's intention. After Part I, on Jesus's own religious experience, Part II deals with 'The Experience of the Earliest Christian Communities': the Resurrection Appearances, Pentecost and an assessment of the retrospective testimony of Acts. Part III, 'The Religious Experience of Paul and of the Pauline Churches' is the longest and richest part of the book. In contrast, 'The Johannine Alternative' occupies only seven pages in the appendix-like Conclusion. The whole work is densely compressed and

heavily documented with nearly 100 pages of notes, which the exigencies of printing today have made it a wearisome task to consult. Doubtless realising what hard work he demands of the reader, Dunn has organised his material clearly on a 'Wittgensteinian' decimal system, and he draws attention to his frequent summary propositions by italicising them, thus producing the semblance of a set of theses, which one hopes will not tempt any readers to a lazy dogmatism.

Thus all is a-bustle with the tools of scholarship, handled by a master. Yet about the scholarly rigour of the work I am still left somehow uneasy. I admire Dunn's work, am glad he wrote this book and find him illuminating on scores of points. With the help of the excellent indices, students will turn to Dunn on all the relevant texts and will seldom be disappointed. The good judgement of his conclusions is admirable (see especially chapter X, concluding the Pauline section). My hesitation, expressed above, concerns the appearance of rigorous objectivity. For example, in Part I the acceptable material for discussing Jesus's subjective experience is reduced by application of strict criteria, but one has a strong sense that the author knows what he is going to 'prove', is confident that he has enough ammunition to impress the opposition, and so makes his estimate of how much he can afford to throw away. Here, perhaps, a more frankly committed standpoint is ultimately more satisfactory, as in the late Tom Corbishley's last work, *The Prayer of Jesus* (Mowbrays, 1976)—no rival, certainly, to Dunn's book, but by no means uncritically 'devotional'. The feeling that the author knows beforehand what he wants to establish keeps recurring. To this reader the picture is a plausible and acceptable one on the whole—though traces of native presbyterianism here, as in the earlier book, invite the rejoinder that another reading of some data is possible, and that a blind eye for sacramentalism is a misfortune in which one might turn with profit to such a physician as Paul Ricoeur.

The expression of these reserves is by no means intended to be damaging, for I do not regard them as in fact damaging the substance of a fine and valuable achievement. But they do point to a final question: would it not, after all, have been more effective to keep to something nearer the

size of *Baptism in the Holy Spirit?* Or—since *Jesus and the Spirit* now exists—could Dr Dunn now give us a simpler and more readable sum-

mary of his personal reading of the New Testament on this vital subject?

ROBERT MURRAY SJ

ST THOMAS AQUINAS: Summa Theologiae. Vol. XXXVII: Justice (II Ilae lvii-lxii), by Thomas Gilby OP. xvi + 138 pp. 1975. £3.15. Vol. LIX: Holy Communion (III lxxix-lxxxiii), by Thomas Gilby OP. viiv + 198 pp. 1975. £4.50. Blackfriars: London: Eyre and Spottiswoode; New York: McGraw-Hill.

Both these volumes are translated and edited by the General Editor of the series, to whose diligence and persistence in a time of unparalleled economic difficulty its completion is, together with the courage of the publishers, most honourably to be ascribed, and whose sudden death last December will be regretted both inside and outside his Order. Both of them consist almost entirely of text, translation and footnotes, with only the briefest of introductions and no appendices, but to allay suspicions of skimping due to either haste or parsimony it should be pointed out that each of them is really a section of a larger treatise and needs to be read in conjunction with the adjoining volumes.

This is specially true of the volume on Justice, which, in spite of its references to Scripture and Christian writers might seem to be concerned with purely natural morality and virtues and to be little more than a rehash of Aristotle. But, as Fr Gilby remarks, 'the theological character of the treatise will be more explicit in the later stages, especially when dealing with religion, or the due worship of God. Here in the opening stages the concern is to lay the material foundations' (p. xiv). And even there 'the sovereign authority is the word of God declared through the Scriptures and the Church, seemingly remote from his [St Thomas's] speech sometimes, but not from his thought' (p. xv). (There is only one minor printer's error that needs noting—on page 98 a misspelling of *antipascho*.)

The limitations of medieval Eucharistic theology, even at its best, are

universally recognised today and St Thomas inevitably shared in them. Nevertheless it is striking how, for example, in spite of his ignorance of the structure of a Jewish *berakah*, he is able, in arguing that the sacramental prayers are well framed, to avoid any serious aberrations of doctrine (III, lxxxiii, 4). In Fr Gilby's words:

The theological principles stand out clear, strong, and lasting. The sacrament-sacrifice is a sign wholly derivative from and relative to Christ, who is not changed by it and whose offering is not added to or repeated in himself, but presented and continued in those who join in it. Yet it differs from the other sacraments in that it holds Christ himself in person [p. xiii].

Fr Gilby's common-sense breeziness stands him in good stead, as when he remarks, with reference to the multiplication of masses, that 'statistics here have little bearing on theology' (p. 136). But it sometimes leads him into imprecision, as when he writes 'under the sacramental species we receive the increase of grace we need for laying hold of the reality' (p. 91, lines 2f) instead of 'we receive the increase of grace, and need the sacramental signs in order to perceive the truth'. And in III, lxxxiii, 1, the translation of *immolo* by 'sacrifice' has the effect of smuggling into the definition part of what it is the purpose of the article to prove.

On p. 55, last line, delete 'mortal' *secundo*. P. 96, note *a*, reference missing in text.

E. L. MASCALL

THE BIBLE IN ORDER, edited by Joseph Rhymer. *Darton, Longman and Todd*, London, 1975. 1,917 pp. £15.

Is this merely an expensive game, an invaluable teaching instrument, or a positively dangerous hybrid? Anyone who teaches the Bible must be

aware of the misconceptions in the minds of students caused by the conventional order in which the Bible is printed. The modern student assumes