

attempt, at a specific point in time, to grapple with the difficulties of belief in God, and it provides a valuable picture of the kind of theological ideas which were current in some Jewish circles at more or less the same time as that at which many New Testament writings were composed.' (p. 304); on chapters 15-16: 'The fact that he (the author) should have made this addition is an indication that, nearly two centuries after it was originally composed and in rather different circumstances, II Esdras 3-14 was still thought to have a relevant message to convey.' (p. 305); and on chapters 1-2: 'The author takes up the question of the relationship of the church to Judaism. His answer that Israel has been completely rejected, and that the church has taken her place, is no

longer satisfying, but the question he raises is one of fundamental importance to practising Christians and Jews.' (p. 305). On what grounds these brief assessments are made is not clear from the commentary. Are ideas worth summarising but not worth discussing?

The commentaries are useful in matters of detail. Each takes the form established for the series, including a brief introduction, a note on further reading and an appendix of names and subjects. In addition, the commentary on Genesis 12-50 contains two line maps. The publication of these two volumes completes the series on the Old Testament and on the Apocrypha. The New Testament series was completed in 1967.

MARGARET PAMMENT

VOICES FROM THE GODS by David Christie-Murray. *RKP*. pp. 280 £6.95

Any conceivable kind of glossolalia is grist for Mr Christie-Murray's mill, with the result that his book makes fascinating reading, but leaves us, as the author probably intends, intellectually unsatisfied. There are just too many different kinds of phenomenon involved. There is the kind of pseudo-language used by witch doctors, there is the alleged language of departed souls in spiritism, there are the tongues of men and of angels in Pentecostalism, there are the odd manifestations reported by doctors and psychiatrists, there are the alleged 'recordings' of praeternatural voices. It is certainly useful to remind those who regard speaking in tongues as a sure sign of the presence of the Holy Spirit that there is an awful lot of speaking in tongues going on in circumstances not, on the face of it, plausible occasions for such a supposed visitation from on high. But if we are to gain anything in understanding a far more thorough investigation of all the different phenomena in their own settings is called for, with far more readiness to

make distinctions. For instance, Christie-Murray discusses psychological and religious arguments for and against the use of tongues in Pentecostalism, but he never attempts to isolate tongues: the alleged effects in every case could be due to something else associated with tongues in Pentecostalism. It would be very valuable to know, for instance, whether the close association found by Kildahl between psychological dependence and glossolalia is found among glossolalists outside neo-Pentecostal prayer groups.

The theological debate about Christian glossolalia is sympathetically discussed, but with very little reference to the abundance of available literature.

The author finds no solid evidence of genuine miraculous xenolalia, though he acknowledges that it is impossible to rule it out in the present state of research. Nor, it seems, has reincarnation yet been proved.

SIMON TUGWELL O. P.

WHAT WERE THE CRUSADES? by Jonathan Riley-Smith. *Macmillan*, London. 1977. £4.95.

THE ALBIGENSIAN CRUSADE by Jonathan Sumption. *Faber*, London, 1978 £7.95.

The worst fault of Mr Riley-Smith's modest but expensive 80 pages is his title. What he has set out to do is to tidy up

some of the background questions books on the larger themes of the crusading movement tend to take for granted. He