

HORIZONS

Volume 34

Fall, 2007

Number 2

ARTICLES

Norbert J. Rigali, S.J., *Moral Theology and Church Responses to Sexual Abuse*

Phyllis Zagano, *Women and the Church: Unfinished Business of Vatican II*

Margaret R. Pfeil, *Called and Gifted: Charism and Catholic Social Teaching*

Donald C. Maldari, S.J., *A Reconsideration of the Ministries of the Sacrament of Holy Orders*

Mark S. Clatterbuck, *Ancient, Postmodern, and Prophetic: How Haight's Symbol Theory (Almost) Does It*

EDITORIAL ESSAY

Lieven Boeve, *Beyond the Modern-Anti-Modern Dilemma: Gaudium et spes and Theological Method in a Postmodern Context*

THEOLOGICAL ROUNDTABLE

The Future of Political Theology

John K. Downey, Maureen O'Connell,

Steven Ostovich, Johann M. Vento

REPORT OF THE COLLEGE THEOLOGY SOCIETY

REVIEW SYMPOSIUM

Mark A. Noll and Carolyn Nystrom, *Is the Reformation Over?: An Evangelical Assessment of Contemporary Roman Catholicism*

Four Perspectives: **J. Michael Utzinger, Peter A. Huff,**
Kimlyn J. Bender, William M. Shea

Author's Response: **Mark A. Noll**

Plus Reviews of 42 Books

THE JOURNAL OF THE COLLEGE THEOLOGY SOCIETY

PUBLISHED AT VILLANOVA UNIVERSITY

HORIZONS

The Journal of the College Theology Society

Published at Villanova University

Volume 34

Fall, 2007

Number 2

ARTICLES

Moral Theology and Church Responses to

Sexual Abuse Norbert J. Rigali, S.J. 183

Women and the Church: Unfinished Business of

Vatican II Phyllis Zagano 205

Called and Gifted: Charism and Catholic

Social Teaching Margaret R. Pfeil 222

A Reconsideration of the Ministries of the

Sacrament of Holy Orders Donald C. Maldari, S.J. 238

Ancient, Postmodern, and Prophetic: How

Haight's Symbol Theory (Almost) Does It Mark S. Clatterbuck 265

EDITORIAL ESSAY

Beyond the Modern-Anti-Modern Dilemma:

Gaudium et spes and Theological Method
in a Postmodern Context Lieven Boeve 292

THEOLOGICAL ROUNDTABLE

The Future of Political Theology John K. Downey 306

Maureen O'Connell 310

Steven Ostovich 317

Johann M. Vento 321

REPORT OF THE COLLEGE THEOLOGY SOCIETY 329

REVIEW SYMPOSIUM

Mark A. Noll and Carolyn Nystrom, *Is the**Reformation Over?: An Evangelical Assessment
of Contemporary Roman Catholicism*

Four Perspectives J. Michael Utzinger 332

Peter A. Huff 338

Kimlyn J. Bender 342

William M. Shea 347

Author's Response Mark A. Noll 352

BOOK REVIEWS

Jane Schaberg, Alice Bach, and Esther Fuchs, eds.,

*On the Cutting Edge: The Study of Women in
Biblical Worlds. Essays in Honor of**Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza* Alice L. Laffey 358

- Richard J. Cassidy, **Four Times Peter: Portrayals of Peter in the Four Gospels and at Philippi** *Leonard J. Biallas* 359
- Robert B. Stewart, ed., **The Resurrection of Jesus: John Dominic Crossan and N.T. Wright in Dialogue** *PHEME PERKINS* 360
- Peter Drilling, **Premodern Faith in a Postmodern Culture: A Contemporary Theology of the Trinity** *Phyllis H. Kaminski* 361
- Christopher Ruddy, **The Local Church: Tillard and the Future of Catholic Ecclesiology** *Daniel B. Gallagher* 362
- Bernard Cooke and Gary Macy, **Christian Symbol and Ritual: An Introduction** *Timothy Brunk* 363
- Richard Sorabji, **Self: Ancient and Modern Insights about Individuality, Life, and Death** *Walter E. Conn* 364
- John D. Zizioulas, **Communion and Otherness: Further Studies in Personhood and the Church** *Radu Bordeianu* 366
- Murray A. Rae, **History and Hermeneutics** *Calvin Mercer* 367
- Paul Lakeland, **Catholicism at the Crossroads: How the Laity Can Save the Church** *Rodger Van Allen* 368
- John Wijngaards, **Women Deacons in the Early Church: Historical Texts and Contemporary Debates** *Phyllis Zagano* 369
- Bernard McGinn, **The Harvest of Mysticism in Medieval Germany (1300–1500)** *E. Ann Matter* 370
- James C. Livingston, **Modern Christian Thought Volume 1: The Enlightenment and the Nineteenth Century**; John C. Livingston, Francis Schüssler Fiorenza, Sarah Coakley, and James H. Evans, **Modern Christian Thought Volume 2: The Twentieth Century** *Gerard S. Sloyan* 372
- Kristen E. Heyer, **Prophetic and Public: Social Witness of U.S. Catholicism** *Thomas O'Brien* 374
- William Madges, ed., **Vatican II Forty Years Later** *Christopher M. Bellitto* 375
- Michael A. Hayes, ed., **New Religious Movements in the Catholic Church** *Paul Lakeland* 376
- Kenneth P. Serbin, **Needs of the Heart: A Social and Cultural History of Brazil's Clergy and Seminarians** *John A. Coleman, S.J.* 378
- Jean M. Bartunek, Mary Ann Hindsale, and James F. Keenan, eds., **Church Ethics and Its Organizational Context: Learning from the Sex Abuse Scandal in the Catholic Church** *Charles E. Curran* 379
- Jean Porter, **Nature as Reason: A Thomistic Theory of the Natural Law** *Edward Vacek, S.J.* 380
- Walter J. Burghardt, S.J., **Justice: A Global Adventure** ... *Suzanne Toton* 381
- Carol R. Taylor, C.S.F.N. and Roberto Dell'Oro, eds., **Health and Human Flourishing: Religion, Medicine, and Moral Anthropology** *Virginia M. Ryan* 382
- Dennis J. Billy, CSsR and James Keating, **The Way of Mystery: The Eucharist and Moral Living** *Tobias Winright* 383

Terry A. Veling, Practical Theology: “On Earth as It Is in Heaven”	<i>Michael P. Horan</i>	385
Thomas Matus, O.S.B.Cam., ed., Bede Griffiths: Essential Writings ; Robert A. Krieg, ed. and trans., Romano Guardini: Essential Writings ; Wendy M. Wright, ed., Caryll Houselander: Essential Writings ; James Brabazon, ed., Albert Schweitzer: Essential Writings ; Marcello Fidanzio, ed., Brother Roger of Taizé: Essential Writings ; Dianne L. Oliver, ed., Dorothee Soelle: Essential Writings	<i>Sally McReynolds, N.D.</i>	386
James L. Connor, S.J., and Fellows of the Woodstock Theological Center, The Dynamism of Desire: Bernard J.F. Lonergan, S.J., on The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola ; William Johnston, Mystical Journey: An Autobiography	<i>Joann Wolski Conn</i>	390
Robert Ellsberg, ed., Flannery O’Connor Spiritual Writings	<i>John D. Sykes, Jr.</i>	392
Stephen Chase, The Tree of Life: Models of Christian Prayer	<i>John V. Kruse</i>	393
Peter Feldmeier, The Developing Christian: Spiritual Growth Through the Life Cycle	<i>Elizabeth Liebert, S.N.J.M.</i>	394
David Tacey, The Spirituality Revolution: The Emergence of Contemporary Spirituality	<i>Wallace N. Fletcher</i>	395
Bradford Hinze, Practice of Dialogue in the Roman Catholic Church: Aims and Obstacles, Lessons and Lament	<i>Peter C. Phan</i>	396
Paul F. Knitter, ed., The Myth of Religious Superiority: Multifaith Exploration of Religious Pluralism	<i>Christopher Key Chapple</i>	397
George Sumner, The First and the Last: The Claim of Jesus Christ and the Claims of Other Religious Traditions	<i>James L. Fredericks</i>	399
Ian Randall, What a Friend We Have in Jesus: The Evangelical Tradition	<i>William M. Shea</i>	400
Shirley du Boulay, The Cave of the Heart: The Life of Swami Abhishiktananda	<i>James A. Wiseman</i>	402
Norman Solomon, Richard Harries, and Tim Winter, eds., Abraham’s Children: Jews, Christians, and Muslims in Conversation	<i>David Burrell, C.S.C.</i>	403
BOOKS RECEIVED		406
INDEX		411

Copyright © 2007 College Theology Society

Printed in the United States of America

HORIZONS

The Journal of the College Theology Society

Horizons, The Journal of the College Theology Society is published biannually in Spring and Fall at Villanova University, Villanova, PA 19085.

Yearly subscription: individual \$16.00, institutional \$40.00. Send remittance, payable to College Theology Society, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331. Changes of address should also be sent to this address. *Horizons* is automatically received through membership in the College Theology Society.

Manuscripts, editorial and business correspondence, book reviews, advertising copy, and orders for single issues (individual \$8.00, institutional \$20.00) should be addressed to The Editor, *Horizons*, St. Mary's Hall, Villanova University, Villanova, PA 19085. Telephone: (610) 519-7302. E-mail: HORIZONS@VILLANOVA.EDU

In submitting manuscripts, please send four clear copies. Author's name should appear *only* on an unpaginated cover sheet, with address and essay's title. No other identifying reference to author should appear on the manuscript. All references to author's work in text or notes should be in the third person. Essay's title should appear at top of first page of text. Notes should be placed on separate sheets at end. Full double spacing should be used throughout, including indented quotations and notes. Top, bottom, and right-hand margins should be at least one inch; left-hand margins at least one-and-a-half. Manuscripts should be accompanied by an abstract of one hundred fifty words or less and an author vita of one hundred words or less. Authors should state that the manuscript will not be submitted to another journal until *Horizons'* evaluation is completed. Manuscripts will be returned if postage is supplied.

Articles appearing in *Horizons* are abstracted and indexed in: *The Catholic Periodical and Literature Index*; *Guide to Social Science and Religion in Periodical Literature*; *Index to Religious Periodical Literature*; *New Testament Abstracts*; *Religious and Theological Abstracts*; and *Social Science Citation Index*. Articles are indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. *Horizons* is available in microform from Bell & Howell, 300 North Zeeb Road, P.O. Box 1346, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346. It is also available on line in full text to ATLAS subscribers.



COLLEGE THEOLOGY SOCIETY

The College Theology Society is a professional organization of college and university professors of religion in the United States and Canada.

The purpose of the College Theology Society is to improve the quality of the teaching of religion: by stimulating and sharing scholarly research; by developing programs of theology and religious studies which meet student needs and interests; and by exploring, evaluating, and encouraging effective ways of teaching which are interdisciplinary and ecumenical.

Annual membership dues in the Society are \$50.00 (Full Professional or Associate), \$50.00 (Joint Professional for husband and wife), and \$25.00 (Graduate Student). Membership in the Society includes a subscription to *Horizons*. Contact Elena Procario-Foley, Religious Studies, Iona College, 715 North Ave., New Rochelle, NY 10801. Telephone: (914) 637-2744. E-mail: EProcariofoley@iona.edu

EDITOR

Anthony J. Godzieba
Villanova University

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Lisa Sowle Cahill
Boston College

Mary Ann Hinsdale
Boston College

Denise Lardner Carmody
Santa Clara University

Elizabeth A. Johnson
Fordham University

Anne Carr
University of Chicago

Paul F. Knitter
Union Theological Seminary, NY

Bernard Cooke
College of the Holy Cross (Emeritus)

PHEME PERKINS
Boston College

Lawrence S. Cunningham
University of Notre Dame

Sandra M. Schneiders, I.H.M.
Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley

Charles E. Curran
Southern Methodist University

William M. Shea
College of the Holy Cross

Margaret A. Farley
Yale Divinity School

Gerard S. Sloyan
Temple University (Emeritus)

Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza
Harvard Divinity School

William Thompson-Uberuaga
Duquesne University

Francis Schüssler Fiorenza
Harvard Divinity School

David Tracy
University of Chicago

BOOK REVIEW EDITORS

Joann Wolski Conn
Neumann College

Eileen Flanagan
Neumann College

BUSINESS EDITOR

Ellen Murray, R.S.M.
*Novitiate for the Institute of the
Sisters of Mercy*

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Irene C. Noble

Walter E. Conn
Villanova University
Editor Emeritus

HORIZONS

The Journal of the College Theology Society

A journal exploring developments in Catholic theology, the total Christian tradition, human religious experience, and the concerns of creative teaching from the college and university environment.

The articles in this issue deal, in one way or another, with Christianity's future. The specific topics that our authors have chosen, the questions and problems they articulate, and the solutions they suggest all have serious implications for both the immediate and long-term health of Christianity, and Catholicism in particular.

Norbert Rigali, in his article, raises the challenging question of whether the manualist moral theology that was taught to previous generations of Catholic students for the priesthood might have had a crucial role to play in the ongoing sexual abuse crisis and the marginalization of its victims. Phyllis Zagano, continuing the line of argument of her award-winning book *Holy Saturday*, examines how the expanded role for women in the church promised at Vatican II might be made actual today. Margaret Pfeil deals with the all-too-often neglected theme of charisms in the Church, especially in relation to the development of Catholic Social Teaching. Donald Maldari argues for a more fully developed theology of ministry that safeguards its sacramental character while at the same time opening the practice of sacramental ministry to all who have made a baptismal commitment. Mark Clatterbuck offers a valuable and critically appreciative analysis of the theory of symbol behind Roger Haight's christology.

Our editorial essay is by one of our European colleagues, Lieven Boeve, the current president of the European Society for Catholic Theology and the author of *God Interrupts History* (2007), the focus of a well-attended session at the 2007 CTS annual convention at the University of Dayton. He suggests that in the current debate over the relation between Christian faith and contemporary culture, the theological category of "interruption" offers a way "beyond the methodological dilemma of modern and anti-modern theologies." "Interruption" also plays a role in the theological roundtable on the relevance and destiny of political theology, in essays offered by John Downey, Maureen O'Connell, Steve Ostovich, and Johann Vento. An earlier version of this roundtable was presented at yet another stimulating session at the 2007 convention, this one based on issues raised in a collection of essays edited by Downey and Ostovich, along with Jürgen Manemann, entitled *Missing God? Cultural Amnesia and Political Theology*.

Along with forty-two other books reviewed in this issue, our review symposium features another aspect of the continuing conversation between Evangelicals and Catholics with an intriguing discussion of Mark Noll and Carolyn Nystrom's *Is the Reformation Over?* Our reviewers' thought-provoking comments are joined by Noll's equally provocative response.

—Anthony J. Godzieba