

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF

Cultural Property

VOLUME 23 2016 NUMBER 4

ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN
CULTURAL PROPERTY DISPUTES:



Merging Theory and Practice

CAMBRIDGE

ISSN 0940-7391

Subscription Information: *International Journal of Cultural Property* (ISSN 0940-7391) is published quarterly in February, May, August, and November by Cambridge University Press for the International Cultural Property Society. Annual subscription rates for Volume 23 (2016): Institutional subscription rate, print and electronic: US \$503 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £302 elsewhere. Institutional subscription rate, electronic only: US \$384 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £231 elsewhere. Individual subscription rate, print only: US \$79 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £42 elsewhere. Single part rates, print only: US \$145 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £87 elsewhere. Prices include surface postage.

Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006. USA (for USA, Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England (for UK and elsewhere).

Society Inquiries: General inquiries concerning the International Cultural Property Society should be directed to Stanley N. Katz, Director, Center for the Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Woodrow Wilson School, 428 Robertson Hall, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544. Phone: 609-258-5637; fax: 609-258-1235; email: snkatz@princeton.edu.

Rights and Permissions: All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm; enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>.

Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: The Item-Fee Code for the publication (0940-7391/10 \$15.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$15.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

Abstracting Information: *International Journal of Cultural Property* is indexed and abstracted in Anthropological Literature; Art and Archaeology Technical Abstracts (Online Edition); ARTbibliographies Modern; Avery Index to Architectural Periodicals; Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA); British & Irish Archaeological Bibliography (Online Edition); IBZ—Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals & Books; Internationale Bibliographie der Rezensionen Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlicher Literatur.

© International Cultural Property Society 2016

Cover: Indian ivory plaque excavated at Begram in 1937, stolen from the National Museum of Afghanistan between 1992 and 1994, and returned in 2012 (National Museum of Afghanistan, inv. nr. 59.1.12). Credit: National Museum of Afghanistan.

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF Cultural Property

VOLUME 23 (2016) NUMBER 4

Editor

Alexander A. Bauer,
Queens College, CUNY, USA

Case Notes Editors

Janet E. Blake, *University of Shahid
Beheshti, Iran*

Derek Fincham, *South Texas College
of Law, USA*

Book Review Editors

Hyung Il Pai, *University of California,
Santa Barbara, USA*

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of
Queensland, Australia*

Associate Editors

Haidy Geismar, *University College,
London, UK*

Sonia Katyal, *Fordham University School
of Law, USA*

Tom King, *Independent Writer/Consultant, USA*

Lyndel V. Prott, *University of Queensland,
Australia*

Kurt Siehr, *Universität Zürich, Switzerland
and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

Editorial Board

Gregory J. Ashworth, *Rijksuniversiteit
Groningen, Netherlands*

Márcia Bezerra de Almeida, *Universidade
Federal do Pará, Brasil*

Gregory Borgstede, *University of
Pennsylvania Museum, USA*

Michael F. Brown, *School of Advanced
Research, USA*

Mira Burri, *World Trade Institute,
Switzerland*

Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, *Denver
Museum of Nature and Science, USA*

María Luz Endere, *Conicet and Universidad
del Centro de la Provincia de Buenos
Aires, Argentina*

Richard Handler, *University of Virginia,
USA*

Claire Lyons, *Getty Museum, USA*

Stephanie Moser, *University of
Southampton, UK*

Elina Moustaira, *Faculty of Law, University
of Athens, Greece*

Dawson Munjeri, *Delegation of Zimbabwe
to UNESCO, Zimbabwe
and France*

Anila Naeem, *NED University of
Engineering and Technology, Pakistan*

James A. R. Nafziger, *Willamette University
College of Law, USA*

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of Queensland, Australia*

Robert K. Paterson, *Faculty of Law,
University of British Columbia, Canada*

Jorge Sánchez Cordero, *Mexican Center of
Uniform Law, Mexico*

Daniel Shapiro, *President Emeritus,
International Cultural Property Society,
USA*

Folarin Shyllon, *Faculty of Law, Olabisi
Onabanjo University, Nigeria*

Samuel Sidibé, *National Museum of Mali,
Mali*

Neil Asher Silberman, *University of
Massachusetts, Amherst, USA*

Madhavi Sunder, *UC Davis School of Law,
USA*

David Throsby, *Macquarie University,
Australia*

Alison Wylie, *University of Washington,
USA*

Board Members Emeritus

Clemency Coggins, *Boston University, USA*

David Lowenthal, *University College
London, UK*

†John Henry Merryman (Founder), *Stanford
University Law School, USA*

Stephen K. Urice, *University of Miami
School of Law, USA*

INTERNATIONAL
Cultural Property
SOCIETY

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

President

Stephen K. Urice
University of Miami School of Law, USA

Vice-President

Marc-André Renold
Art-Law Centre, University of Geneva Law School, Switzerland

Treasurer

Stephen W. Clark
J. Paul Getty Trust

Secretary

Ana Filipa Vrdoljak
Faculty of Law, University of Technology, Sydney, Australia

Derek Gillman
Drexel University, USA

Stanley N. Katz
Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA

Lawrence Rosen
Department of Anthropology, Princeton University, USA

Kurt Siehr, Law School
Universität Zurich, Switzerland and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany

Susan Taylor
New Orleans Museum of Art, USA

President Emeritus

Daniel Shapiro

CONTENTS

VOLUME 23 (2016) NUMBER 4

SPECIAL ISSUE:

Alternative Dispute Resolution in Cultural Property Disputes:
Merging Theory and Practice

EDITORIAL

*Editorial: Alternative Dispute Resolution in Cultural Property
Disputes: Merging Theory and Practice*

Maria Shehade, Kalliopi Fouseki and Kathryn Walker Tubb 343

ARTICLES

*The Politics of Culture and the Culture of Politics: Examining the
Role of Politics and Diplomacy in Cultural Property Disputes*

Maria Shehade and Kalliopi Fouseki 357

*Putting into Place Solutions for Nazi Era Dispossessions of Cultural
Objects: The UK Experience*

Charlotte Woodhead 385

False Closure? Known Unknowns in Repatriated Antiquities Cases

Christos Tsirogiannis 407

*Alternative Dispute Resolution and Insights on Cases of Greek
Cultural Property: The J.P. Getty Case, the Leon Levy and
Shelby White Case, and the Parthenon Marbles Case*

Irini Stamatoudi 433

*The “Begram Ivories”: A Successful Case of Restitution of Some
Antiquities Stolen from the National Museum of
Afghanistan in Kabul*

St John Simpson 459